Gender Equality in Your Company

The Recipes for Success

Written by Vicki Donlevy and Rachel Silvera
Illustrations by Hillar Mets
## 1. PREFACE

**Foreword**
Introduction by the authors

## 2. BENEFITS

Working up an appetite: how do companies benefit from promoting gender equality?

## 3. METHODS

How to prepare for successful gender equality recipes?

## 4. RECRUITMENT

Recipes for recruitment: *Ensuring gender equality in recruitment practices*

## 5. CAREER DEVELOPMENT

Recipes for training and career development: *Ensuring gender equality in training and career development*

## 6. GENDER PAY GAP

Recipes for wages: *Ensuring gender equality in wages and job evaluation systems*

## 7. WORK-LIFE BALANCE

Recipes for work-life balance: *Ensuring gender equality in work-life balance practices*

## 8. ANNEXES

Annex 1: Gender Equality “Health Indicators”

Annex 2: Reminder of the obligations imposed by the Gender Equality Act on all enterprises

Annex 3: Useful tools, contacts and websites
These guidelines (manuscript) were drawn up within the framework of an Estonian-French Twinning project “Equality between Men and Women – Principle and goal for effective and sustainable enterprises” (http://www.sm.ee/est/pages/goproweb1849).

© Ministry of Social Affairs of the Republic of Estonia

The guidelines have been published in Estonia:
The material was translated into Estonian by Tõlkekunstnikud OU
Edited by Gender Equality Department of the Ministry of Social Affairs of Estonia and Päevakera OU
Published by Ministry of Social Affairs 2008
Printed by Baltic Graphics OÜ
ISBN 978-9985-9802-6-2

The project and the production of the guidelines have been supported by the European Commission through the Transition Facility programme 2006.

The information contained in these guidelines does not necessarily reflect the opinion or the position of the European Commission.
Estonian companies are today in a new environment, in borderless markets with growing competition. For survival in such conditions, companies need to accept European values, adapt to new legal norms, and acknowledge the need to think and act in a socially responsible and sustainable way.

People are the main resource for all companies and organisations. This has also been acknowledged by Estonian managers who year by year have started to value finding and keeping quality employees. Four out of five managers believe that treating men and women equally in a company attracts better and more able candidates in the future. Therefore social responsibility entails a concrete benefit for the employer and the company.

These guidelines are meant for private sector managers who are interested in developing their companies by investing in people and who are not afraid of the words “gender equality”. Of course this recipe collection can be used by other kinds of managers and people who are interested in this topic as well.

The guidelines are written in the format of a recipe book and contain activities (recipes) that can be used for improving company policies for recruitment, wages, training and career advancement, and work-life balance. We chose the recipe format for its simplicity and user-friendly approach. Also, we aimed to create a compendium which would consist of independent parts, so that they can be followed optionally, according to every organisation’s individual needs and possibilities.

This recipe book is meant to be an introduction to the topic of gender equality in the labour market / companies. Those who are more interested in the topic can also benefit from reading a textbook “Gender aspect in the organization” and a manual “Shaken, not stirred” (both published by the Ministry of Social Affairs of the Republic of Estonia).

Kadi Viik
Head of Gender Equality Department
Ministry of Social Affairs
April 2008

---

Bonjour… Before leaving you to discover the recipes and techniques for the successful implementation of gender equality policies in enterprises - divulged in the following pages for the very first time - we would like to take a few minutes of your time to present this “recipe book”.

Why this recipe book?

In Estonia, despite the fact that men and women participate more or less equally in the labour market, their situation is clearly different and unequal in several aspects:

- There is a 25% average wage gap between women and men: the joint highest in the European Union\(^4\);
- Men and women in Estonia tend to work in different sectors: for example, 83% of employees in the “health and social welfare” sector are women, whereas 71% of those in the “transport, storage and communication” sector are men\(^5\);
- The employment rate for mothers with three or more children is 39%; that of fathers with the same number of children is over 89\(^6\).

Although the Gender Equality Act was adopted in 2004, very few companies are aware of its contents and the importance of its goals.\(^7\) Not dealing with inequalities hinders the development of the country in general. Actors from the public, private and third sectors all have a key role to play in improving the situation on the labour market.

Promoting gender equality in an organisation involves employers, employees, their representatives and special consultants (e.g. lawyers, management and recruitment consultants, gender equality experts).

The good news for employers is that implementing gender equality policies is not purely altruistic. By ensuring that equal opportunities for women and men are a reality in your company, you can contribute significantly to its success.

As shown in Chapter 2, gender equality policies bring long-term business benefits including increased productivity and performance, improved recruitment, reduced absenteeism, positive publicity and protection from unwanted legal claims.

---

\(^4\) Eurostat 2005: Differences between men’s and women’s gross hourly earnings as percentage of men’s average gross hourly earnings.


\(^6\) Eurostat 2003

Other chapters of this recipe book introduce and explain the opportunities and measures that can be used to promote gender equality in recruitment, developing employees and improving their working conditions.

**Who is the recipe book for?**

The recipe book specifically targets key actors from the private sector, including:

- Company directors and managers
- Human resource managers and staff
- Employee representatives and trade unions
- Employers’ organisations and branch confederations
- Business schools and other business training organisations
- Experts and consultants working with private sector companies

It can be equally relevant for public sector enterprises, researchers and other institutions wishing to improve gender equality in their organisation.

**What will I find in the book?**

The cookbook is divided into different, easily-digestible sections and recipes:

- Working up an Appetite: How do companies benefit from promoting gender equality?
  - Economic benefits
  - Public relations benefits
  - Compliance with legislation
  - Benefits for society

- How to Prepare for Successful Gender Equality Recipes?
  - Analysing the gender equality situation in your enterprise
  - Gender equality training for staff, top-level commitment, designating responsibility on this issue…
  - Developing social dialogue on gender equality
  - Building partnerships for gender equality

- Recipes for ensuring gender equality:
  - in recruitment
  - in training and career development
  - in wages
  - for work-life balance
Annexes:
- Gender equality “health” indicators
- The Gender Equality Act
- Useful contacts and tools

How should the recipe book be used?

Throughout the cookbook, we have tried to include real-life examples from companies. As the recipes have been written by French experts, many of the examples come from French companies or experiences: we have however made a particular effort to include as many foreign (UK, Finnish, US, etc.) examples as possible. But, as it is well-known that French cuisine is the best in the world...!

The authors of the recipe book

The cookbook was written by the two French “chefs”, or gender equality experts, from the twinning project: Rachel Silvera and Vicki Donlevy.

Vicki Donlevy: has more than thirteen years’ experience in the field of gender equality. Today Head of the International Department and Senior Programme Manager at RACINE, a French organisation specialised in European programmes in the field of employment and training, she has been responsible, among others, for gender equality programmes (mainly in the European Social Fund) for more than ten years. In this context, she has assisted hundreds of organisations running gender equality projects, and is an advisor for the French Ministry of Employment. She has written publications on good practices in gender equality from European projects, a set of guidebooks on gender equality, as well as various reports and articles. She runs gender mainstreaming training courses and, in 2005/2006, managed a contract for promoting gender equality in Guadeloupe, which included establishing a Gender Equality Network. She participates in the management of the French website on gender equality in the ESF: http://egalitedeschances.racine.fr. She carried out a research project on gender mainstreaming in regional level ESF, and has participated in several EU-level expert working groups on gender equality. She has carried out expert missions in many EU Member States in this field.
Valuable support for the authors, including assistance with layout, research for Estonian statistics, work on the annexes and guidance to discovering Estonia, was provided by Alain Laferté, Resident Twinning Advisor (RTA) and Ursula Toomri, Assistant to the RTA.

At each stage, the different elements of the cookbook were discussed and validated by the team of Estonian chefs, experts from the Gender Equality Department of the Estonian Ministry of Social Affairs: Kadi Viik, Käthlin Sander and Ülle-Marike Papp.

Finally, the cookbook was tested and validated by an Estonian round table, composed of experts linked to different organisations from the private sector including the Estonian Business School, the Association of Small and Medium-Sized Companies in Estonia, the Estonian Employers Confederation (ETTK), the Confederation of Estonian Trade Unions (EAKL), Enterprise Estonia (EAS), the Estonian Employees’ Union Confederation (TALO), as well as different experts from Estonian ministries (Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications...). We would like to extend our thanks to each of them for giving up their time to read the first draft, and for their very useful comments and suggestions.

It remains only for us to wish you happy reading of this recipe book, which we hope will allow you make many successful gender equality dishes in your enterprise.

Bon Appétit!

Vicki Donlevy & Rachel Silvera
March 2008
In order to test new recipes, a chef needs to be given inspiration.

In the same way, this chapter aims to whet your appetite for implementing gender equality “recipes” in your enterprise by presenting the business case.

The following pages aim to outline some of the main benefits, supported by examples from companies and from research results. We have organised the benefits into four sections:

- Economic benefits
- Public relations benefits
- Reducing the risk of legal claims
- Benefits to society
In each recipe proposed later in the book (chapters 3, 4, 5, 6), we detail the specific benefits of each type of gender equality policy for your enterprise in the section “Nutrition facts: the benefits for the health of your company”.

The Economic Benefits of Gender Equality
“Recipes”

Improving Productivity and Performance

Introducing gender equality policies really can result in rises in enterprises’ productivity and performance. Employees (whether male or female) who feel that their needs are being considered will work better and be more productive. Achieving more balanced proportions of women and men in certain sectors and professions (for example, increasing the number of women in the IT sector, or the number of men in childcare professions) has been shown to create an improved working atmosphere. Revisiting and revamping various human resource policies to ensure gender equality often leads to greater economic efficiency.

In 2004, a nationwide study was carried out in the USA on 353 companies on the connection between gender equality and the creation of added value in business. Women’s participation on the highest corporate bodies was used as a key indicator of achieved equality between women and men, while yield of capital and total return to shareholders served as indicators of value creation. The results showed that the group of enterprises with the highest women’s participation rate in their top management had a much better financial performance than the group with the lowest women’s percentage: the yield of capital was 35.1% higher, and the return to stakeholders 34% higher. The result was the same in every economic sector considered. These positive results are clearly therefore linked to gender equality, whether they be due to the higher rate of women managers, or to a better gender balance in the enterprise.

Study: “The Bottom Line: Connecting Corporate Performance and Gender Diversity”, Catalyst (www.catalyst.org)

Improving Recruitment

Introducing fairer recruitment procedures and practices, targeting both women and men, will help attract better candidates for posts, and can help in finding suitable candidates in sectors lacking qualified manpower. This last point is particularly relevant in the current Estonian economic context where there are major manpower shortages in certain fields. For further details on the benefits of addressing recruitment procedures, refer to the chapter “Recipes for Recruitment”. 
Reducing Absenteeism

Experience from different companies has shown that another of the positive effects of introducing gender equality policies has been a reduction in levels of employee rates of absence. The causes of this drop are multiple:

- resolution of difficulties in work-life balance (transport, childcare, working hours...),
- all employees feeling that they are valued,
- introduction of new, better working methods (for example, women joining the construction sector has often led to the introduction of safer working methods which are beneficial for all categories of staff),
- creation of a better gender balance leading to an improved working atmosphere...

All of which contribute to an enhanced working environment for all employees (men and women) and thus lower levels of absenteeism.

In the City of Rennes (Brittany, NW France), an initiative was taken to improve the working conditions of the (mainly female) cleaning staff, in order to help alleviate the acute work-life balance difficulties which they had been facing. Instead of asking the cleaners to work outside “normal” working hours of other municipal staff (early in the morning or late at night), the City introduced new working hours: from 7.30 till 15.30, or from 10.45 till 18.45. Furthermore, cleaners started working in pairs, were given full-time contracts and vocational training in order to ensure career advancement. Following these positive changes to the cleaners’ working environment, the City recorded a drop in absenteeism of 45%, and a rise in productivity of 15%.

See SILVERA, BUSEYNE & DONLEVY “Articuler vie professionnelle et vie privée“, 2005 (p.64) (www.racine.fr)
Reducing Staff Turnover

Retaining qualified, experienced and competent staff is a challenge for any employer, and a recognised business advantage. This too is particularly important in Estonia, where there is a scarcity of suitably-skilled staff on the labour market. Employees who are more content with their working environment and possibilities of advancement, whatever their gender and life situation, will have a greater level of job satisfaction, and will be willing to stay with the company for longer periods of time. The introduction of gender equality policies is one of the ways in which employee satisfaction can be increased and maintained.

The UK company Farrelly Engineering and Facilities has introduced a work-life balance strategy to combat the negative effects of over-long working hours. For example, no one is allowed to start work before 8.30 am, work later than 5 pm, or take work home. There is a daily meeting for everyone to share their problems, and total flexibility for family emergencies. As a result, as the company states, “staff turnover has decreased dramatically”. Furthermore, since introducing the changes, sales have more than doubled, and they are expecting more than three times this amount in the following year. Wastage on site has reduced from 15% to 1.5%: “Customer complaints and defects are almost a thing of the past”.

See Working Families (http://www.workingfamilies.org.uk/asp/awards/a_casestudies.asp)

Increasing the Number of Women Returning to Work after Maternity Leave

Caring for children requires a significant amount of attention and time from both parents, and employers should take account of the fact that nowadays more (particularly highly educated) women wish to return to working life after having children and continue with their careers.

If companies do not properly manage maternity leave and the return to work, there is often a major loss of qualified female staff. If women are made to feel cut off from their employer during maternity leave, or devalued on their return to work, they will seek other employment opportunities or even choose not to work. Companies that introduce programmes to ensure a smooth departure from work for maternity leave, maintain contact during the leave and make efforts to re-integrate returning staff in a positive manner retain these staff members more successfully.
Public Relations Benefits of Gender Equality

“Recipes”

Free Positive Publicity

Companies implementing gender equality strategies often attract media interest, becoming the subject of articles in the press. Companies may also be selected to receive awards (business awards or national prizes), thus attracting major positive public attention. All positive publicity of this nature is highly beneficial for the company’s brand image, its ability to attract high-level candidates and investors, and its appeal to potential customers.

As cited by a study carried out by McKinsey & Company, to adapt to changing social and consumption trends, companies increasingly need to integrate women into their decision-making processes, as women now have a major influence on purchase decisions: in Europe, they are the driving force behind more than 70% of household purchases, although they account for only 51% of the population. Even in industries where buyers are traditionally male, women represent a growing proportion of the consumer base, for instance in the car industry.


At British Petroleum Amoco (BPA), advice and an information pack are available on all aspects of maternity rights are given to all women going on maternity leave. Once an employee is on maternity leave, or on another form of career break, they can be kept up-to-date via the “Keep In Touch” scheme. The scheme also helps with queries about return-to-work dates, childcare, networking with other parents and access to the company in-house literature. As a result, among other positive elements, maternity return rates have increased from 50% to 99%.

See Working Families (http://www.workingfamilies.org.uk/asp/awards/a_casestudies.asp)
Corporate Social Responsibility

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) is about organisations managing their businesses to make a positive impact on society and the environment, with the aim of sustainable development, whilst maximising value for their shareholders. Enterprises use sustainability reporting, based on guidelines such as the Global Reporting Initiative (GRI), to communicate their economic, social and environment performance. Long-term investors now use these criteria to decide which businesses they invest in. Gender equality is one of the key social criteria used to assess the social impact of enterprises: it is therefore crucial for companies to implement gender equality policies both for their external corporate image, but also for their attractiveness to investors.

Capital markets and investors are paying more and more attention to corporate performance in terms of gender diversity. For instance, investment funds such as Calpers in the US or Amazone in Europe include this indicator among their investment criteria, while rating agencies (Core Rating, Innovest, Vigeo) are now developing tools to measure gender diversity.


“Ethical Stakeholders” is a European network of committed business investors and share-holders. In 2002, they launched a Gender Equality Campaign to promote this principle in the workplace. Under the auspices of this campaign, different initiatives took place. For example, the Swedish organisation Sisyfos wrote to the management of 11 major companies (H&M, Volvo, Electrolux...) to ask them to detail the concrete means which they were implementing to increase the number of women on their Board of Directors and in management. As a follow-up, many of these companies asked the organisation to speak on this subject at their general assemblies.

---

9 See www.globalreporting.org
Compliance with Gender Equality Legislation: Reducing the Risk of Legal Claims

European and national legislation requires employers to treat employees of both sexes in an equal manner in all fields: pay, promotion, access to training, recruitment… These measures protect the fundamental rights on which our societies are based\(^{10}\) and, for this reason alone, should be respected.

However, if an employer does not respect these legal measures, they are also leaving themselves open to potential legal claims for gender-based discrimination. Legal complaints can, not only lead to heavy fines, but also to negative publicity in the public eye (and thus among potential customers) and poor social relations within the enterprise. Implementing a proactive strategy to ensure that gender equality is being both respected and promoted in your company can avoid the dangers of being in a situation of non-compliance with legislation.

Details on the Estonian Gender Equality Act, highlighting the requirements for employers, can be found in the annex documents of these guidelines.

\(^{10}\) See extract from the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights 1948 on the following page.
Benefits to Society: the Enterprise as an Actor of Change

Implementing gender equality policies benefits not only enterprises themselves, but also society at large. Gender inequality is related to several social issues including poverty of children and women and negative birth rates. As demonstrated above in the section on Corporate Social Responsibility, companies are increasingly recognizing and taking responsibility for their role as key actors of change in society. Some of the benefits to society are the following:

Respecting Fundamental Rights

Our societies are based on a certain number of fundamental rights. The United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) reminds us of one of the foundations on which our societies are built: “All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights […] without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status”. These same principles are set out in the constitutions of individual Member States, and in the treaties of the European Union. Men and women should have equal rights in all fields, including education and employment. Businesses, as important actors in society, play a key role in ensuring the respect of these principles.

Alleviating the Burden of the Ageing of our Societies

It is well-known that, across the European Union, our societies are ageing. Increasing numbers of people are retiring, and also living longer, and must be supported by the population of working age. Ensuring that the entire population of working age (men and women) are given the means to work and be productive, is one way of helping to alleviate the “demographic time bomb”. Enterprises have a key contribution to make to this goal.

Renewing the European Population: Raising Birth Rates

For many decades, the birth rate in Europe has been dropping, exacerbating the problem of our ageing populations. It has been shown the societies which implement policies to support parents in achieving a better work-life balance (childcare strategies, parental leave and return to work, working time arrangements…) have a greater birth rate (Scandinavia, France). Enterprises too can play a role in this support to parents by implementing their own work-life balance strategies.

Ensuring a Return on Investment in Education

Our societies invest heavily in education for the entire population, including both men and women. If, after leaving the educational system, girls and boys are not given
equal opportunities for access to all types of professions and to all levels of responsibility, society is not maximising its return on the investment made in the education of the entire population. By ensuring that equal opportunities are a reality in their own workplace, companies have a key contribution to make in this field too.
"Before everything else, getting ready is the secret to success." (Henry Ford, 1863-1947)

As any successful chef knows, it is impossible to produce top quality food without having made sufficient preparations beforehand. Great dishes do not simply appear from nowhere, but are the result of careful preparations.

The same applies to gender equality policies and programmes in enterprises. In order for them to be successful, it is essential to prepare the terrain properly. This crucial preparatory phase is not necessarily costly or time-consuming, but does require the involvement and commitment of key actors from across the company, as well as careful planning.

There are four basic first steps to preparing your company for successful gender equality policies, as follows:

- Assessing and analysing the current gender equality situation in your enterprise
- Ensuring the commitment of all staff to gender equality
- Encouraging social dialogue for gender equality
- Setting-up external partnerships
What is the Current Gender Equality Situation in Your Enterprise?

Before deciding what kind of a dish to prepare, you need to find out what ingredients you already have. Also, it is important to know what the special requests and needs of other people who will be joining you for the meal are.

Similarly, introducing new gender equality policies without first measuring how the enterprise is performing in this field, and identifying current strengths and weaknesses, is a sure recipe for under-performance, or even failure.

Guidelines for preparing a description of the current situation

- Firstly, **company statistics and data should be gathered** in the fields set out below. For each, the overall figure should be obtained, and then in each case differentiated by sex (M/F = male/female):

  The following list is an example from which you can choose the data that is most suitable for the profile and needs of your company (size, sector, length of operation, critical problems, etc.). In addition you may need other indicators, which will point out the differences of the status of men and women in the company.

  - **Staff structure**
    - Overall number of employees (M/F)
    - Employees (M/F) by type of contract (permanent, fixed-term,...)
    - Employees (M/F) in different departments/sectors/jobs
    - Numbers (M/F) in different levels of management, and on the board of directors
    - Level of education (M/F)

  - **Working time**
    - Numbers of employees (M/F) working full- and part-time
    - Overtime worked (M/F)
    - Shift-workers and night workers (M/F)
    - Possibility and take-up of flexible working arrangements (M/F)
    - Opportunities and take-up of remote working\(^{11}\) (M/F)
    - Absences from work, and reasons (M/F)

  - **Recruitment policy**

\(^{11}\) The term ‘remote working’ describes a variant on the traditional office based work model. With the help of IT equipment and/or telecommunications tools, the remote worker can complete his/her job from various locations such as home or other branch offices. This can offer a higher degree of flexibility and cost benefits to both the worker and the organisation.
• Numbers of candidates (M/F) having applied for jobs
• Numbers of candidates (M/F) having been selected for jobs
• Departures (M/F)

• Wages
  • Average overall wages (M/F)
  • Allocation (M/F) of other forms of payment: bonuses (monetary and non-monetary), overtime, performance-related pay...

• Family leave policy
  • Information on maternity and paternity policies
  • Take-up (M/F) of parental leave possibilities
  • Arrangements (M/F) available for caring for sick children or other relatives

• Career advancement
  • Promotions (M/F) awarded over recent years

• Training
  • Participants (M/F) in in-house and external, company-funded training

• Working environment
  • Physical working environment and differences (for example, changing rooms for men only on building sites) (M/F)
  • Occurrence of harassment (general or sexual) or discrimination in the workplace (M/F) and measures taken

See Annex 1 for data collection form created by the Ministry of Social Affairs

• Secondly, the data gathered must be analysed, to see whether there are particular differences between men and women, and if so, in which fields. In general, if a human resources department or manager exists, it is they who carry out this analysis: in the case of smaller companies, this analysis can be carried out either by a designated member of staff or, ideally, the company director. Help can be requested, when possible, from outside specialists, other managers, or employee representatives.

• Finally, the results should be presented to management and employee representatives (or in the case of smaller companies, to employees directly), for discussion. The results can be used to:
  • Indicate the starting point for the gender equality strategy or plan: statistics can be measured annually as an indicator for improvements (or setbacks) in the field of gender equality;
  • Highlight the areas of company policy where action to promote better gender equality needs to be taken.
Deliberate discrimination against men or women is very unusual in enterprises. However, company managers often do not realise that, by the type of policies they implement, they are, unknowingly, causing prejudice to one sex or another.

The City of Kajaani (Finland) carried out an analysis of its current situation regarding gender equality. This study came up with a number of interesting findings. At the end of 2003, although the City employed a majority of women overall (73% of staff were women), their proportion among supervisors was lower (61% of supervisors were women). Furthermore, the survey showed significant differences in wages: the average overall salary of women was €2,002, while that of male employees was €2,343; the average salary of women supervisors was €2,752, whereas that of men was €3,202. As a result, the City drafted an equality plan, in partnership with the labour unions of the municipal sector.
How can you ensure the commitment of all staff to gender equality?

In any professional situation, whatever the size of a company, management must ensure that the company’s goals are clear for staff at every level. Each should be aware of the procedures to follow and tools to use. If not, different staff may pursue conflicting objectives, leading to counter-productivity.

Likewise, the messages on gender equality which an enterprise gives to its staff, at every level, must be clear and unequivocal. Staff must be made aware of the objectives, and the means to achieve them. The following actions can be taken:

- **Making a formal, top-level in-house commitment** to gender equality. This commitment should be made at the highest level (managing director). In larger companies, the support of the board of the directors and/or other managing staff should be sought. It should be formalised in writing in company documents (annual reports, company brochures and literature, company website...) and strategic plans. Other managers must be made aware that they will be held responsible for the application of this principle. The importance of ensuring communication to all staff cannot be overstated.

The Charities Commission in the UK has published their gender equality statement of commitment on their website. This statement starts with the following: “The Charity Commission is committed to making sure that equality of opportunity is an integral part of all that it does. We expect everyone in the Commission to understand and meet their responsibilities under the Gender Equality Scheme. We take seriously our duties as an employer, and understand the additional benefits that good diversity management brings for all our employees. We also seek to use this scheme to demonstrate our on-going commitment to meeting the needs of the men, women and transgender people who use our services”.

For further details, see http://www.charity-commission.gov.uk/tcc/gender.asp.

- Ensuring that this commitment is translated into the use of **gender-sensitive language and proofing** of all company communication tools, texts and media (website, brochures, internal procedures, reports, advertisements and other marketing tools...). This means, for example:
  - using the masculine and feminine forms of different job descriptions;
  - making clear (through a clear statement) that all job, promotion and training opportunities are open to both men and women;
any images used should show pictures of both men and women, in all types of jobs (male child carers, female mechanics...).

- Using gender-neutral language can serve to reinforce stereotypes about traditional roles for women and men in the workplace, and in society. For example, on hearing the word “secretary”, we often imagine a woman whereas, on hearing the word “mechanic”, we would automatically see a man.

- **Designating responsibility for gender equality** to a person, team or - in the case of large enterprises - a committee. This person or group of people, who should be of a significantly senior level, can carry out a variety of coordination activities relating to gender equality in the enterprise:
  - Distribute information and new data (figures, research findings, new laws, information from other enterprises, websites...) in paper (newsletter) and/or electronic format (web pages, e-mails...);
  - Monitor and chart the implementation of actions in favour of gender equality in the enterprise;
  - Liaise with outside expert organisations on gender equality, and participate in networks of organisations working on gender equality;
  - Ensure that the current gender equality situation (see section 1) is regularly measured, and examine the results to observe change;
  - Provide training and answer staff questions on gender equality issues;
  - Provide updates and input on gender equality initiatives in management or staff meetings and, for larger companies, on the board of directors.

- **Training and raising the awareness of all staff.** It is very difficult for staff to understand what is meant by “gender equality”, and its concrete application in the workplace, without some form of training or awareness-raising. Different training programmes can be set up for staff (in larger companies, different staff categories can have specifically-tailored training), carried out by in-house trainers or by external gender equality experts (university experts, consultants, training companies). All staff should receive some basic training, but more advanced training should be given to key staff members in larger companies such as middle managers, recruiters, human resource personnel and employee or trade union representatives. Regular training updates should also be implemented in order that staff do not forget the lessons learnt over time. The importance of this training must be publicly recognised by the company management.

- It is very important to make clear the fact that one person or team has been given specific responsibility for coordinating action in the field of gender equality does not mean that it is not the concern of other staff members. Everyone is responsible for carrying forward this principle.
Training in gender equality can address such themes as:

- differences between the situation in men and women at work (statistics),
- legislation and rights on gender equality,
- how gender equality is applied in your company,
- overcoming stereotypes (using examples of stereotyped adverts from newspapers),
- concepts and terms regarding gender equality,
- the benefits of gender equality…

- Testing awareness of gender equality in managers’ reviews for pay/promotion. One way of ensuring, in larger companies, that managers do take this question seriously, and showing how important this issue is within the company, is to integrate an assessment of gender equality sensitivity into the reviews carried out of managers’ performance, in their annual assessment, or for pay increases or promotion. Managers will be expected to show how they promote this principle in concrete terms.

In Eaux de Paris (Paris Water Board), a test on ethical management has been introduced into examinations leading to promotions. This involves evaluating all candidates for management posts on their aptitudes to manage without discrimination. A case study is proposed to candidates which allows the examiners to assess their legal knowledge and behaviour as regards equality and diversity. The candidate has an hour to analyse the situation and propose practical solutions in front of a jury. The score obtained in this test counts for 25% of the final score relating to the promotion. In order to prepare for this test, each candidate receives 10 hours’ training on this theme.
How Can You Foster Social Dialogue for Gender Equality?

“The most basic of all human needs is the need to understand and be understood. The best way to understand people is to listen to them.”
Ralph Nichols, Business Communications Expert, University of Minnesota

In order to introduce any new policy, managers need to present it to the staff, discuss it with them (or their representatives), and listen to their opinions and proposals. By ignoring their points of view or trying to impose the new rules, he/she is taking an enormous risk of staff rejection. Once staff are fully convinced of the benefits of the changes being proposed, they will often propose new ideas for improvements themselves.

Similarly, working with staff and/or employee or trade union representatives on the theme of gender equality can give a powerful impetus to policy in this area, and confers responsibility to staff and the social partners on achieving the gender equality principles.

Staff and social partners can be involved, among others, in the following ways:

- If a formal commitment to gender equality is introduced, seek the approval of employees and/or their representatives. This ensures that staff and/or their representatives will support the commitment and carry it forward in their own
work too. Employee/trade union representatives can be powerful partners in gaining employee acceptance of new policies and procedures in this area.

- For larger companies: if an equality committee exists or is created, bring the employee and/or trade union representatives on board. Their involvement constitutes another way of gaining their support and co-responsibility for the gender equality goals and strategy.

- If an in-house gender equality advisor has been designated, he/she should meet with the employee and/or trade union representatives.

- Opening negotiations on gender equality with the employee and/or trade union representatives, with the possibility of leading to the signing of an agreement in this field. When setting-up negotiations, it is important to ensure that men and women are both fairly represented at the negotiating table. In many Member States, such agreements have been instrumental in ensuring major advances and commitments in the field of gender equality in enterprises and/or economic sectors. Agreements can be at company-level (for larger companies) or at branch or national level, thus ensuring the coverage of smaller companies which make up the majority of companies in Estonia.

In EDF (Electricité de France), the collective agreement on gender equality states that a “fair gender balance will be sought in the joint working groups, in the negotiating groups and in the employee representative organisations, both by management and trade unions”.

- Direct contact with employees on gender equality through tools such as surveys and questionnaires. These tools, which can also be anonymous, can provide valuable insight into employees’ opinions on gender equality policies within the enterprise, maintain the theme in the employees’ line of visibility and make employees feel that they have a role to play in deciding policy in this area, instead of having policies imposed upon them with no discussion.

- Organising discussion sessions on gender equality: particularly in smaller companies with less hierarchical levels and organisation of employee representation, it can be beneficial to introduce short (one to two hour) discussion sessions on the issue of gender equality. The manager (or other designated responsible person) can bring some input to the meeting (statistics, suggestions for changes in favour of gender equality), as well as pre-defining topics for discussion (for example, improving work-life balance for all employees). This will allow all employees to be confronted first-hand with these proposals, and be given the opportunity to make suggestions.
Which partners can be useful for promoting gender equality?

In order to be efficient in promoting gender equality, enterprises should seek, where possible, external assistance and partnerships. This may be particularly appropriate for smaller companies with less in-house resources. Possibilities include:

- **Receiving and seeking advice and assistance on gender equality from external organisations.** Help in implementing gender equality policies can be obtained from a variety of organisations (see the list of useful contacts in the annex) including NGOs and university experts.

- **Working in public-private partnerships to advance gender equality and change stereotypes.** It is sometimes not enough to promote equal access to certain posts (i.e. access of men to childcare positions) within enterprises because, in the labour market, there are simply not enough men who go into training in this field. It is therefore important for enterprises, and their representatives (employer confederations), to work with other organisations such as schools and training colleges, or local employment agencies, to promote gender equality in access to all professions. Employers of all sizes can take part in recruitment fairs or school visits, and use role models in a non-traditional job (i.e. a male elderly care nurse) to show young people that it is possible to have a career in the field concerned. Such a strategy can ensure a greater choice of candidates for recruitment, and provides a positive image of the enterprise in the community.

*SME nursery provide, Puffins of Exeter, found that boys attending careers fairs were rarely interested in talking about opportunities in childcare. So, two young men who have recently completed their apprenticeship agreed to accompany the training manager to careers events and talks in schools to help engage male pupils in discussions.*
In October 2007, the energy company **Total** and France’s most prestigious engineering school, the Ecole Centrale Paris, have joined forces in order to encourage more schoolgirls to take up scientific careers. In the engineering school, 20% of students are women, prompting the school to launch the “Centrale Paris Initiative for Women (CPIW)“. Total, which has been engaged in an initiative to increase the number of female staff since 2001, wants to increase the number of young girls specialising in science subjects in order to ensure a greater pool for the recruitment of women, and so, in the long term, increase the number of female managers. The Managing Director of Total is Co-Chairman of the CPIW. The CPIW’s first action has been to conduct a survey into the image of scientific subjects for schoolgirls and their parents. As Jean-Jacques Guilbaud, Human Resources Manager of Total France says: “Based on these survey results, we will, in partnership with the Ecole Centrale, implement a long-term strategy to attain 50% of women”.

- **External publicity about the company’s commitment to gender equality.** Letting suppliers and subcontractors know about your company’s gender equality strategy and commitment is a way of influencing them to consider a similar strategy. Communicating on this subject to customers, and to the general public, can be a very effective way of gaining good publicity, and signalling to staff that there is real commitment to this policy.
Recruitment is the first decisive step of all human resource policies. It is also one of the main “recipes” for promoting gender equality. Selecting candidates is the first step to achieving a balanced proportion of men and women in different occupations, by for example promoting the access of women to male-dominated professions and the access of men to female-dominated occupations.

Very often however, enterprises consider that a disproportionate number of men or women employees is not the fault of their own practices: “there are no male candidates in our female-dominated sector”. The results of the survey of Estonian companies (see below) show that a large majority of interviewed companies do not monitor the proportion of men and women that they recruit, even if many of them consider that certain jobs are specifically “feminine” or “masculine”. But certain practices can change this situation, and attract a more balanced number of male and female job applicants.
A handful of company data

- Indicator 1: the number and proportion of women and men in the enterprise, by occupational category / department / field (e.g. marketing, finances)
- Indicator 2: the number and proportion of women and men recruited each year
- Indicator 3: the number and proportion of women and men candidates for jobs

A good dose of staff mixed with willingness, reflection and organisation

- Recruiters
- Human resource department (for large companies)
- Person/team who defines the job vacancy profile (head of department for large companies or company director for smaller companies)
- Recruitment agency (if appropriate)

Data on recruitment

Results of the survey of Estonian enterprises (Ministry of Social Affairs, 2007):

- 22% of the managers consider the gender of the applicants as a very important (7%) or important (15%) criteria in making recruitment decision;
- 59% of the managers consider there are some positions in their company for which mostly women or mostly men apply;
- However, 95% of the managers have not compared the relative share of men and women who have applied for jobs in their company within the last couple of years;
- 96% of the managers have not compared the relative share of men and women among the employees who have been hired in their company within the last couple of years.

Legal framework: Gender Equality Act

§6: (1) “In professional life, cases in which an employer selects for employment (...) hires (...) a person of one sex and overlooks a person with higher qualifications and of opposite sex shall be deemed to be discriminating, unless there are strong reasons for the decision of the employer or such decision arises from circumstances not related to gender.”
(2) “The activities of an employer shall also be deemed to be discriminating if the employer: (...) upon hiring, establishes conditions which put persons of one sex at a particular disadvantage compared with persons of the other sex.”
**Basic Recipes:**

How to integrate gender equality into all phases of recruitment?

1. **Choice of recruitment mode:** it is essential to diversify traditional recruitment modes in order to ensure gender equality. As shown by the survey of Estonian companies, male-dominated companies often use their networks of acquaintances for recruitment, particularly for top managers. This practice means that the same type of profiles (and often gender) are constantly recruited: the employer is not choosing from the full range of potentials available on the labour market. All companies should use a range of networks for recruitment and vary the way in which job advertisements are publicised (internet, newspapers, magazines, outdoor media, etc.).

2. **Writing the job vacancy description - defining the skills required:** the starting point of any recruitment procedure, in particular when seeking equality, is to clearly define the required criteria for each job vacancy. It is essential to concentrate on the skills and competencies required for a job, rather than on other notions (male/female, nationality, school attended…) which can cause bias in the recruitment procedure through preconceived ideas about what the ideal candidate's profile should be. For example, review whether the criteria of geographical mobility - which can be a discriminatory for single parents for example – is really necessary for the particular job vacancy.

3. **Drafting the job advertisement:** before drafting the advertisement it is important to examine, and take into account, the proportions of men and women previously recruited for posts of this type (see indicators 1 & 2). Ensure that no gender-based reference appears in the advertisement. When they exist, use the masculine and feminine forms of job titles (male director/female director for example) in order to make it clear that the job is open to both women and men. If the advertisement includes an image (photo or drawing), show the under-represented gender (for example, a female bus driver). Refer to the skills and experience required for the job, and not to other characteristics of the potential candidate (geographical mobility, availability, school attended) which may give rise to unintentional bias in recruitment. Bear in mind that it may be beneficial to limit the number of criteria published to the essential in order to attract the most diversified mix of candidates: it has been shown that women are less likely to respond to job advertisements where the job description does not exactly fit their profile.

4. **If using the services of a recruitment agency:** give clear instructions to the agency in order to avoid any source of discrimination in the writing of the job advertisement, the selection, the interviews. Make sure that the agency provides a balanced mix of male and female candidates. Choose, by preference, an agency which has awareness of gender equality issues, or consider proposing that someone from the agency participates in your company’s gender equality training (see chapter 3).

5. **Selecting the candidates:** retain the most diversified profiles, at equivalent levels of skill and experience. Diversity should be seen as a source of potential wealth,
not of danger. Try to avoid any (often unconscious) prejudices which may impact negatively on one gender or the other. For example, do not immediately reject the CV of a person with a career gap due to a period of parental leave: the person concerned may have potential and have even gained extra, informal skills (i.e. organisation, time-management...) during their leave which can be useful for the enterprise (as long of course as the candidate has the basic skills requirements for the post).

6. **Carrying out the recruitment interview**: conduct interviews concentrating on the match between the skills required and those of the candidate, without taking into account their personal situation. Delete any questions on the candidate’s personal situation (for example childcare arrangements, plans for more children, family constraints). A single father, or a person with responsibility for a disabled brother, can also be a valuable and committed employee. Where possible (in larger companies), conduct the interview with a small team (at least 2 people), and try to ensure a mix of women and men in the interview team.

7. **Organising the job induction of new types of staff - improving work organisation and conditions**: in order to welcome new staff profiles, it may sometimes be necessary to adapt the physical working environment. For example, when women are employed on building sites, it is necessary to build changing rooms for them. The changes made to working conditions in order to accommodate new female staff (such as reducing the strenuousness of work in factories or the weight of loads carried for furniture deliverers) are often equally beneficial to existing (or new) male staff.
1. **Using the “Anonymous CV”**

In order to avoid indirect indiscrimination (i.e. recruiting only men or women “involuntarily”), a staff member (for example an assistant) can be asked to delete all references in the CVs received to personal characteristics (gender of course, but also age, nationality...) before being passed on to the recruiter(s). This avoids “involuntary” bias in selecting for job vacancies, and should help to “naturally” rebalance the enterprise’s diversity.

2. **Using the “Simulation Method”**

Instead of choosing candidates based on CVs you can use a more practical simulation method for recruiting or as a part of that procedure. Recruiting in that case would consist of the following steps: 1) on-site analysis of the job vacancy on offer in order to define, with the company concerned, the aptitudes required; 2) creation of practical tests designed to measure the aptitudes of the candidates for the job on offer; 3) assessment of the candidates using the tailor-made tests; 4) presentation of the candidates who were successful in the tests for interview.

ℹ️ This method is particularly suitable for mass recruitments in large companies or to find candidates for job vacancies for which there are recruitment difficulties. It offers the advantage of an individualised response thanks to tests adapted to the job on offer. It can be used for all economic sectors and for all types of jobs.

The aptitudes being measured are the necessary capabilities for carrying out a job. They are transferable from one situation to another. Aptitudes can be developed in a professional context or not, and rarely appear on a candidate’s CV.

The practical tests or exercises recreate the conditions of the job on offer: each candidate carries out (alone or in a team) a series of concrete activities while respecting the work organisation, following instructions and norms and aiming for a clearly-specified result. The tests allow recruiters to observe the ways which candidates face up to, and resolve, the difficulties presented to them.
3. **Ensure a fair proportion of women and men in recruitments**

Enterprises can also seek to have the same proportion of women/men recruited as the proportion of women/men in the job applicants (*see indicator 3*), at strictly identical skills levels. This method requires recruiters to measure the proportion of candidates by sex and, once the selection process is completed, to retain the candidate (male/female) on the basis of his/her sex (of course, assuming skills levels are equal).

4. **Implement a positive action**

The highest level requires giving preference to the under-represented gender – still at *strictly identical levels of competency*. This method demands revisiting certain recruitment practices: for example, if the enterprise only usually recruits staff with a certain type of diploma, or from male- or female-dominated schools and colleges (*see indicator 4*), it must consider opening recruitment to people with other qualifications and from other educational establishments. This change sometimes allows finding staff with the same levels of competency, meanwhile introducing greater diversity into the enterprise.

- Promoting a better mix of men and women in recruitment diversifies the profile of job applicants and thus offers greater richness to the enterprise in terms of innovation and creativity. An enterprise with staff with homogenous profiles can be an obstacle to efficiency;

- Opening recruitment up to diversified profiles is a good response to a lack of suitable manpower. This is particularly pertinent in the current Estonian context;

- Improving work conditions and organisation is a source of well-being for all (better employee satisfaction, reduction in number of absences for illness or accidents...).
Chef’s Notes and Warnings

- It is important to find suitable ways of explaining this new approach to recruiters in order that they do not feel that it represents a criticism of their past practices, but rather a new tool available to them. The implementation of these procedures upsets recruiters’ traditional working habits, and requires that they be given some awareness of the principles of gender equality (see the section on staff training and awareness-raising in chapter 2);

- Candidates of the sex which traditionally predominates may feel excluded by these new procedures and consider that the measures implemented constitute unfair favouritism. This approach may therefore be more realistic in a context, as in Estonia, where there is a lack of qualified manpower, rather than a situation of high unemployment. In any context, it is important to explain that these new recruitments are being carried out whilst ensuring that new staff have all the skills required for the post.

- The principle of « proportionality » would seem more adapted to enterprises with a low level of female or male staff (lower than 30%) because it is less restrictive than a quantitative target. But this principle has a limit: the number of “spontaneous” female applications is generally low in those sectors where young girls do not receive much encouragement to enter training (traditional industries). This is equally the case in female-dominated sectors (health, care services...) where few boys enter training. It is therefore necessary to also carry out preparatory actions with the educative system in order to also work on the careers guidance of pupils (girls and boys).

Team Cooking: With Who and How?

Partnerships with educational establishments and local job centres are a bonus for this type of approach (see chapter 2). The absence of candidates from both sexes for certain gender-segregated jobs requires working with schools and colleges to “give rise to vocations” from young people.

Hosting IT workshops for teenagers: In the UK, several employers including IBM, Microsoft and Pfizer have partnered e.skills and hosted a « Go4IT » workshop. The workshops are aimed at 14 year-old students and promote a positive, exciting and up-to-date image of IT and related industries. Many employers choose to focus the workshops on girls as part of their drive to improve the recruitment of women into IT careers. Companies have reported that it has enabled them to extend their reach into the community and work with more schools.
Working in partnership with the local employment agency on job vacancy descriptions, and on the profiles of potential job candidates, can be useful, particularly in sectors for which recruitment is difficult. The “Simulation Method” of recruitment (see above) can be supported by the local employment agency. It allows going beyond the usual recruitment criteria (experience and qualifications), and thus indirectly favours more diversified recruitment.

As mentioned above, recruitment agencies must themselves be familiarised with the company’s gender equality strategy.

**Opinions and Experiences from Other Chefs**

“Currently, we receive eight times more applications from men than women. When we opened the factory, we had such an uneven balance of women and men that we started a campaign stating that everybody had a chance at Toyota, including women. This campaign encouraged them to apply. [...] We have very precise recruitment criteria. We assess the indispensable aptitudes and particularly the motivation, willingness to teamwork and to progress. In this way, we have recruited many people who had no relevant diploma or experience in industry”.

Mr Fayol,  
Communications Manager at  
Toyota Cars. Valenciennes. France

“I think the real benefit of having women and diversity in a team is that you have a richer set of ideas. So, I truly believe there is a direct relationship between team performance and having a diverse team with the best talents”

Vice-President Europe of a leading global healthcare company

**A US Orchestra: Letting the Curtain Fall Before the Concert...**

In the USA, as elsewhere, orchestras have an improving gender mix, but a gender specialisation persists: women tend to dominate stringed instruments, while men predominate in wind instruments. In order to change this situation, during auditions for musicians, a jury decided to let the curtain fall between themselves and the candidates. Thanks to this new form of “anonymous” audition, there was for example a significant increase in female trumpetists!
AXA Assurance (an insurance company): The Anonymous CV

The anonymous CV is a means of clearly showing commitment to equal opportunities in the access to the recruitment process. Through this guarantee of equal opportunities, AXA Assurance aims to encourage categories of the population who are potential victims of discrimination to apply to job offers for sales staff which are published by the enterprise. In classic, non-anonymous recruitment procedures, these people would perhaps have disqualified themselves before trying. Thus, the anonymous CV aims to avoid potential forms of discrimination, conscious or unconscious, linked to the age, gender and origins of the candidate. This procedure consists of carrying out a first selection of candidates based only on their education/training and professional experience. As soon as a CV arrives on AXA’s website (recrute.axa.fr), the following data fields are masked before being sent, by intranet, to the teams in charge of recruitment: first and last names of the candidate, sex, date of birth, address and e-mail address. An automatic e-mail is sent to inform the candidate that he/she has been pre-selected. The person is asked to contact the person in charge of recruitment by telephone in order to agree on a meeting. There is therefore no longer any anonymity after the automatic e-mail is sent. When an application is not successful, an automatic e-mail informs the candidate and the CV remains anonymous.

The French Railway Company (SNCF) Tries to Respect the Proportion of Women Candidates

The SNCF signed an agreement on the 8th March 2006 which commits it to “recruit each year, for each occupation in the “workers” category, (...) a proportion of women reflecting at least the proportion of female applications received” and to “recruit, for the “executive” category, a proportion of women equivalent to the number coming out of the educative system for each type of training corresponding to the needs of the enterprise.

Innovative Campaign by Local UK Company to Attract Men into Childcare Services

A Children’s Information Service in North East Lincolnshire (UK) produced a banner board for display at the local football club with the slogan “Think working in childcare is just for women?... Think again!”, and photographs of male childcare workers with children. It also placed recruitment advertisements in the football club’s programmes. This campaign led to a significant increase in the number of men applying for, and gaining, jobs in childcare in the local area.
Air France Seeks to Break Down Traditional Gender Patterns in Recruitments

Air France organises forums and meetings for educators and students in order to present the different occupations available. This action is carried out in partnership with the Ministry of Education. The aims is change the traditional occupation division in aviation: more men can be found in specialist occupations like pilots and mechanics, while more women are in service-related jobs (retail, ticket reservations, air hostesses...). They wish to encourage men to take up traditionally female jobs, and vice versa.

Increasing the Number of Women Recruited in the French Banking and Aeronautics Industries

In France, the banking sector signed an agreement on gender equality in the workplace on the 15th November 2006 which highlights that banks employ a majority of women (55%), but that they are only 36% of company executives. The agreement commits the signatories to go further: a quantitative objective of 40% of women in the total number of executives is foreseen as an intermediary step from now until 2010, but in the end equal numbers of men and women (50%) is the target. Similarly, EADS (aeronautical industry) has committed to increasing the number of women recruited to at least 20% for all occupational categories (within 2 and a half years), whereas there is currently only 16% of women. In 2006, 22.6% of total recruitments were of women (20.5% in 2005), therefore going beyond the enterprise’s targets.
Why “Cook” Career Development Recipes?

Men are more likely to be found in senior management roles across all types of organisations and within all sectors. The barriers preventing women from reaching senior levels are collectively known as the “glass ceiling”. The glass ceiling may apply to men in certain specific enterprises, but is much rarer: even if female-dominated occupations such as teaching or care work, there are proportionately many more men at the management level than women.

Barriers blocking, or braking, women’s or men’s access to the full range of jobs, in all departments, are known as the “glass walls”.

Several factors underpin the “glass ceiling” including:

- women’s disproportionate responsibility for caring for children, sick people, and older people;
- organisational cultures which esteem and reward stereotypically male attributes;
- prejudices according to which women are not suitable for managerial jobs;
- inflexibility in working arrangements for employees operating at senior level;
- stereotypical assumptions about women’s capabilities and talents.

However, women are often over-qualified for the jobs which they do: they constitute therefore a “pool of talent” which companies would be well-advised to better use.

One way of breaking through the glass ceiling is promoting women’s access to in-house training.

According to the survey of Estonian enterprises, a great majority of companies do not today compare the promotions and career development of male and female staff: it is therefore very important to start using this approach.

Although all the recipes in this section could also be used for male staff, it is the case that women are under-represented at management level in every European country, including Estonia. It is for this reason that the majority of recipes are specifically aimed at women, in order to attain real gender equality in this crucial sphere. The aim is not to create special advantages for women, but to reach a situation where there is a level playing field for both women and men in respect to career development.

**List of Ingredients**

**A handful of company data**

- Indicator 1: number and proportion of women and men in management and senior management (if possible with their evolution over many years)
- Indicator 2: number and proportion of women and men in the « talent pool » of high potential staff (if this is measured) (only applicable to large enterprises)
- Indicator 3: number of women earmarked for top management positions in the human resource future planning (if this exists)
- Indicator 4: for larger companies, proportion of female managers in different departments (“support” services (i.e. legal, HR…) and “strategic” or operational roles (i.e. sales, production…)
- Indicator 5: proportion of promotions by sex, according to the number of male/female employees in different categories
- Indicator 6: number of promotions as a result of participation in training courses
- Indicator 7: proportion of women in training courses (leading to a formal qualification)
A good dose of staff mixed with willingness, reflection and organisation

- Human resource department (for larger companies) or manager
- Board of Directors (for larger companies)
- Senior Management or Company Director

Data on training and career development

Results of the survey of Estonian enterprises (Ministry of Social Affairs, 2007):

- 88% of the managers consider that personnel managers in companies should be aware of equal treatment norms and receive relevant training;
- 97% of the managers have not compared the promotions and careers advancements of male and female employees and the relative share of men and women among the employees who have taken part in training courses;
- 64% of the managers use acquaintances of the management as a channel to recruit managerial staff. It is the most frequently used channel.

Other data:

- Young Estonian women are better educated than young Estonian men, but also better than other young European women: in 2006, almost 90% of Estonian women aged 20-24 had « at least upper education attainment level », compared to 74% of Estonian men, and 80% of European women, in the same age-group. The share of women among tertiary students is the second highest in Europe (after Latvia). Among these students, only 38.8% have chosen studies in sciences, mathematics or IT (but the European average is 37%).
- The proportion of women “managers, legislators and senior officials” is only 37%, but puts Estonia in the third place in Europe (after Lithuania and Latvia).
- But, according to a European Commission study (2005-2006) on women in decision-making, none of the 16 Estonian companies on the stockmarket have a chairwoman (the European average is 4%), and women represent 15% on boards of directors (11% in Europe).
- Finally, according to the findings of a 2006 Estonian survey, women (8.5%) take part more in life-long training than men (4.2%). But these figures mainly concern general training, and less the training offered by companies. Women train less than men overall (19.3 hours, compared to 23.6 hours for men).
Legal framework: Gender Equality Act

§ 6 (1): “in professional life, cases in which an employer selects for employment or a position, (...) admits to practical training, promotes, selects for training or performance of a task or sends for training a person of one sex and overlooks a person with higher qualifications and of opposite sex shall be deemed to be discriminating, unless there are strong reasons for the decision of the employer or such decision arises from circumstances not related to gender”

§8: “discriminating offer of employment or training: (...) training which is [are] direct at persons of one sex only is [are] prohibited unless the reasons specified…”

§11: “Employers as persons promoting gender equality [...] 2) ensure that the number of men and women hired to different positions is as equal as possible and ensure equal treatment to them upon promotion”.

Basic Recipes:

Increasing the proportion of women in continuing training

Based on the results of the indicators 5, 6 and 7, it is important to ensure that women have equal opportunities for access to training leading to the highest qualifications, and to promotions. This is the preliminary step to facilitating equal opportunities for career development for women, and to fighting against glass ceilings and walls. In order to do this, a series of simple measures can be implemented:

1. **Use in-house information channels** (such as intranet) to announce available training courses and vacant posts (ensuring that the announcements are not discriminatory – see the “Recipes for Recruitment” part).

2. **Identify the obstacles to participating in training** for all employees (for example, during annual assessment interviews, or by an employee survey…) and adapt the way training sessions are organised to accommodate employees’ constraints, particularly those of parents: timetables of training courses (not too early or too late), possibility of “modularising” training (into days or half-days), training sites (as close as possible to the company), possible childcare problems (seek temporary solutions for parents, or reimburse the extra costs generated…), consider the possibility of distance learning (e-learning).
1. Make sure that the proportion of the under-represented sex is respected in promotions at every level 🍓

Using indicators 5 and 6, companies can monitor the number of women and men who achieved a promotion and, as long as competency levels are the same, promote the under-represented sex. Management can also decide to introduce a “proportionality” criterion i.e. to promote as many women as men (or vice versa); or to promote a proportion of women equivalent to their proportion in the category concerned... or even go further (🍰🍰🍰) and implement a positive action (using of course equal skill levels) by promoting – for a given period – more women than their actual proportion in a category in order to catch-up on an imbalance.

2. Creating a pool of high-potential female candidates for promotion 🍓🍰

(only suitable for large enterprises)

By studying closely indicators 1 to 4, the company can adapt different measures in order to give priority to women in the pool of high-potential staff:
- Select high-potential staff by a mixed panel (at least one man and one woman);
- Ensure that the board of directors supervises and validates the profiles selected - the lack of female profiles should systematically be justified;
- Revise the system for managing high-flyers: for example change any obligations regarding geographical mobility...;
- Train managers of high-potential staff in order to avoid over-reliance on “personal” factors (marital status, children, age...) or time-related criteria (exclusion of part-time staff...) in selection criteria.

3. Implementing a mentoring or coaching system 🍓🍰🍰

Mentoring is a sort of personal support system, with a precise programme and clear objectives: improving access to high-level posts. The mentor is a senior-level manager, and the “mentee” is a high-potential member of staff. The themes discussed during mentoring meetings include advice on changing jobs, conflict management and personal organisation. More information on the different types of mentoring, and practical examples, are available in a booklet which can be downloaded from: [http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/equal/products/sup/pro-029.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/equal/products/sup/pro-029.pdf).

Coaching is a more formalised individual accompaniment with a personal coach, who is generally an external consultant. These meetings aim to assist the employee in changing their job, and managing all the personal and other changes which this
causes. Coaching can therefore promote the access of the under-represented sex to decision-making posts or to activities where there is an unequal mix of men and women. Both systems can be used in both small and large companies.

4. Development of women's networks

Traditionally, women are less present in the formal, informal, in-house and outside work networks than men. It is well-known that these networks often assist men's career development. Nowadays however, mostly due to women's own initiatives in sectors and enterprises with a low number of female staff, new female networks are being set up in Europe (particularly in the UK where websites describe hundreds of networks, for instance: www.womenintothenetwork.com). This technique allows women to gain contacts, both within and outside their company, to understand the "informal" processes of co-optation, to obtain and exchange professional information and even job and promotion opportunities. Networks can organise events for meeting and discussing specific topics, on-line directories of business contacts, provide role models and mentors in different industries and produce newsletters. Umbrella organisations can also be set up, bringing together lots of smaller networks to pool mutual resources.

5. Development of networks of equality-friendly enterprises

Increasingly, enterprises are also recognising the benefits of working together and exchanging on equality issues, including gender equality. In different countries, they are coming together to form equality (or gender equality) networks. These networks allow members to share their difficulties and solutions, promote successful methods… and often also provide visibility and free publicity (press, other companies, public…) for equality-friendly companies. The networks can also organise joint events and produce joint publications (newsletters, websites, guidebooks).
• Using the full potential of all employees in your company has obvious advantages: less wastage of training investment, new in-house resources for posts which were sometimes difficult to fill, improvement of in-house selection procedures (transparency, internal communication...), increase in employee satisfaction levels...

• The evaluation of mentoring programmes reveals several positive effects for the mentees, (self-awareness and familiarity with female role models, support and advice concerning both professional and personal issues...). Companies getting involved often find that mentoring schemes help them to attract and retain qualified female employees.
Chef’s Notes and Warnings

- There is a risk that certain company employees, or even certain managers find it hard to accept that special measures are being implemented for the under-represented sex in order to give them equal access to management positions. This type of initiative should therefore be accompanied by an awareness-raising campaign for all employees, to demonstrate that the measures are important, and that anyone promoted, of either sex, will have the required level of competency.

- It can often be noted that, despite the implementation of these measures, women still only gain access to posts in “support” departments (such as human resources, sustainable development…), and much less frequently to the “hard-hitting” departments (strategy, finance, international development…). Even when women are qualified in male-dominated areas (i.e. engineers), they still often end up as managers in “support” departments, and are less present at senior management level.

- The development of mentoring, coaching and networks most often corresponds to executive-level staff, and supposes a relatively large number of staff. But simplified elements of these measures can be addressed to smaller units or companies: mentoring, for example, can be carried out in an informal or spontaneous manner. Similarly, women from SMEs can participate in inter-company female networks and benefit from the advantages they can offer.

Team Cooking: With Who and How?

- Companies can join forces with other companies (in the same local area, working in the same sector, suppliers, customers…) to create new networks.

- Companies can make use of the services of research organizations or training companies to find out what kind of explicit and implicit rules, prejudices and attitudes are hindering women’s careers in the company.

- They can also get in contact with already-existing networks of women workers or equality-friendly companies.

- Gender equality experts can always provide useful information.
Opinions and Experiences from Other Chefs

“Positioning more women at the top of the ladder leads to better organisation”
Extract from the study “Gender Diversity, a Corporate Performance Driver”, McKinsey & Company

“We don’t recruit women because they’re women, but because they’re competent!”
Mr Vandamme, Managing Director of Trilec (since replaced by a young women aged 32!)

“A true strategy for introducing a better mix of men and women into jobs requires that women can have the same careers as men, the same possibilities of career advancement”
Extract (article 9) of the French multi-sector collective agreement on gender equality (1st March 2004)

“At least for the most well-publicised among them, women’s networks are principally for female executives. This is because the higher they rise in company hierarchies, the more they are excluded and discriminated. When they are (exceptionally) promoted into the highest spheres, the gender wage gap becomes colossal [...] Our combat seems elitist, but in fact it concerns everyone: things can only get better. In concrete terms, more female managers should lead to a better gender mix in the rest of the company pyramid”
Eliane Moyet-Laffon, Chairwoman of HRM Women (recruitment advice agency)

“We regularly promote women to managerial posts in operational or strategic departments. This is becoming increasingly common – and the women are appreciated very much – both in computer services companies, and in IT departments, as supervisors of project managers. However, we do not receive any requests for senior directors, which remains a male domain reserved for men”
Sandrine Frey, Manager of IT Activities in the Hudson Recruitment Agency

“It’s great to have support from another woman in the industry who knows what it’s like to be out there working in construction. It’s not really something you can explain to friends and family. It’s reassuring to know that someone can understand and is there to give you a hand”
Paula Bleanch, Design Co-ordinator in Construction, mentee

Experience of Male Mentoring in Northern England

At Sheffield Children’s Centre, male applicants have been given mentors who reflect their gender, social and cultural backgrounds. The centre’s induction programme also directly acknowledges their minority status.
Gender and Technology Equal Development Partnership (UK, Finland, Germany)

This programme aims to develop tools for women’s mentoring in the fields of science, engineering, construction and technology (SECT). It was started by two universities with vast experience in supporting young women to access career paths in SECT, a major ICT company and a resource and training centre that accompanies girls to prepare for and successfully complete initial training in non-traditional occupations.

Two different categories of mentoring are demonstrated through practical examples: the developmental type where mentees volunteer to be supported by mentors to develop themselves in a relationship, usually with someone from outside the workplace, and sponsorship mentoring where mentees are backed by their manager to climb the corporate ladder.

Group mentoring and networking in Finland

A group mentoring experiment was piloted by the company ABB, one of the world’s largest engineering companies. The idea was to give female engineers, at a company dominated by men (women only make up 17% of employees, mostly among the clerical staff), a chance to meet and get to know each other, share tacit knowledge and gain support on their career path. Engineering students from the Helsinki University of Technology were also invited to the meeting. The ABB women’s network comprised some fifteen graduate engineers of whom approximately ten attend any given meeting. After the initial session where group members get to know each other, themes have included launching a career, supervisory and project management duties, and international assignments.
Reducing the gender pay gap is very difficult to implement because it is rarely the result of direct discrimination (different basic salaries for men and women in equivalent jobs). Very often, it is the effect of non-deliberate measures which have indirect effects (criteria used to measure executive performance, promotions given to present staff…). In Estonia, individual wage negotiations are very widespread and also one of the reasons why women, who tend to ask less money for jobs than men, are paid less for the same jobs.

Furthermore, measuring wage inequalities is difficult: which indicator should be used? The hourly wage (as used by Eurostat), or the monthly wage (and so the number of hours worked)? Should we only address equal posts or also think about “posts of comparable value”, as specified by the law? These considerations probably explain the results of the survey of Estonian companies: few enterprises wish to deal with this theme, despite the fact that the gender wage gaps in Estonia are the largest in Europe.
Bridging the wage gap helps to create and maintain a fair wages system, decreases subjectivity in assessing work, and guarantees the comparability of various jobs.

**List of Ingredients**

**Large handful of company data**

- Indicator 1: Average monthly wages (men/women) by category (blue-collar, white-collar, management...) and, if possible, by occupation (secretary, engineer...) – basic salary and bonuses
- Indicator 2: Average annual wage increases by category, occupation and sex
- Indicator 3: Number of women and men in the ten highest wage-earners in the company

**A good dose of staff mixed with willingness, reflection and organisation**

- Human resource department
- Head of department (for defining pay rises, bonuses...)
- Outside expert (if appropriate)

**Data on wages**

Results of the survey of Estonian enterprises (Ministry of Social Affairs, 2007):

- 32% of the managers consider dealing with equal pay between men and women is likely to give rise to opposition among employees;
- 96% of the managers have not compared the average wages between male and female employees within the last couple of years;
- 73% of managers do not see any need for comparing hourly female and male wages in their company;
- 66% of the companies do not use job evaluation process, 48% of the managers declare the wages depend on the results of work.
Other data:

According to Eurostat data, in 2005 in Estonia, the difference between men’s and women's average gross hourly earnings is 25%\(^\text{12}\) (compared to a European (EU27) average of 15%). This constitutes one of the largest pay gaps in Europe, together with Cyprus (and may even be higher for monthly earnings).

Estonian statistics show that this gap is largest for “technicians and mid-level specialists” (31.9%), and smallest for manual (“plant and machine workers”) or agricultural (“skilled agricultural and fishery workers”) workers, where there are less women.

Legal framework:

- Gender Equality Act

\(\S 6\): (2): “The activities of an employer shall also be deemed to be discriminating if the employer \(\vdots\): establishes conditions for remuneration or other conditions which are less favourable regarding an employee or employees of one sex compared with an employee or employees of the other sex doing the same or equivalent work”

\(\S 7\) (3): “An employee has the right to demand that his/her employer explain the bases for calculation of salaries \(\vdots\)”.

\(^{12}\) This figure represents the difference between men’s and women’s average gross hourly earnings as percentage of men’s average gross hourly earnings.
• **Wages Act**

§ 5. “It is prohibited to increase or reduce wages on the grounds of an employee’s sex […]. It is prohibited to reduce wages on the grounds of the marital status, family obligations […].”

§ 5¹ “(1) The establishment of different wage conditions for the same or equal work to employees of different sex is prohibited.

(2) At the request of an employee, the employer is required to prove that the employer has adhered to the principle specified in subsection (1) of this section and any preferences given were based on objective circumstances not connected to sex. Employees have the right to request explanations concerning the bases for calculation of wages. […]

(4) Upon hiring, employers are required to inform employees of the regulation of equal remuneration by law.”

---

**Basic Instructions**

1. **Carrying out a basic equal pay review:** an equal pay review involves comparing the pay of women and men doing equal work, investigating the causes of any gender gaps and closing any gaps that cannot satisfactorily be explained on grounds other than sex. The essential steps for carrying out an equal pay review¹³ are listed as follows:

A. **Comparing** the pay of men and women doing equal work, at equal levels of qualification, age and seniority. The easiest level for doing this is to compare the average (hourly or full-time) wages of men and women by wide occupational categories (blue-collar workers, white-collar workers, technicians and mid-level managers, managers).

You need to check for like work (grade, occupation); work rated as equivalent; work of equal value (*use indicator 1*). If you wish (or are able) to go further, a job evaluation system can be introduced (see below).

Also, differences in average seniority levels should be examined for each category.

B. **Identifying and examining** any pay gaps. Significant pay gaps (for women and men performing equal work) are generally considered to be those of 5% of more. Significant patterns of basic pay difference (i.e. women consistently earning less than men for equal work at most or all grades or levels in the organisation) are generally considered to be those of more than 3%. Any significant pay gaps or patterns of basic pay difference will require more explanation and exploration.

¹³ For further information, see: [www.closethegap.org.uk](http://www.closethegap.org.uk)
C. Eliminating any gaps that cannot satisfactorily be explained on grounds other than sex. This should be done by implementing a form of “equal pay action plan” including measures to:

- Provide equal pay for the under-privileged category. For practical reasons, it may not be possible to implement equal pay immediately; however, employers must be aware that, in the interim, they are vulnerable to equal pay claims. The equal pay action plan should specify the timescale envisaged. A specific budget could be set aside with a timetable for implementation in order to divide the cost over a number of years.
- Change the pay policies and practices that contribute to unequal pay. Recruitment, training and other policies may also be linked to the pay differentials identified. In larger companies, this should involve human resource staff and line managers, and may require training sessions to change previously accepted practice.
- Introduce an equal pay policy: this may be helpful in order to state the company’s commitment to equal pay, with regular monitoring and revision. Employees or their representatives should be involved in this process.
- Introduce ongoing monitoring of pay for men and women.

Equal pay reviews can be carried out by enterprises of any size (as long as there are two employees to compare).

2. Neutralising the effect of maternity leave on wages

This means giving a pregnant woman, the year of her maternity leave, the average general and individual wage rise in her category (or enterprise). This means considering the leave period as if it were a period of effective presence.

More Advanced Recipes

1. Consider the other forms of pay: bonuses, fringe benefits

Equal wages does not only apply to the basic salary: it also includes all the other aspects of remuneration: bonuses for seniority, performance, or linked to certain jobs; benefits in kind (car, accommodation...); profit-sharing bonus payments (particularly prevalent for example in financial jobs, on the stockmarket...). These bonuses are not always equally shared between different jobs, and explain part of the wage gaps between men and women).
A. **Bonuses linked to certain jobs:** these can be explained by the different nature of certain posts (for example, bonus for difficult or strenuous work conditions, night-working, overtime...). They are linked to posts, and can be justified by the employer. But this is not always the case. For example, in the automobile industry, there were two clearly distinct workshops: on one hand, for cable-manufacturing (employing only women) and, on the other, for metal-working (with only male staff). However, the bonus for difficult work existed only in the metal-working workshop, despite the fact that in cable-manufacturing, the postures and work rhythm could equally justify earning the same bonus.

B. **More individualised bonuses:** constitute an increased risk of inequality. The criteria used for these bonuses are not always clearly specified. But employers must be able to justify the reasons for attributing them. How are staff assessed? Certain criteria can be considered unequal in themselves: for example, long hours of presence at work, non-availability (which can penalise parents, often women, with family responsibilities, who are model employees). Do part-time workers also have the same access to these bonuses?

In either case, for greater transparency, it is beneficial to make information on bonuses known to all staff (for example, where possible, via employee representatives).
Example

In a company in the water industry employing 600 workers (23% female), women represent 29% of managers, 26% of technicians and supervisors, and 16% of manual workers and office employees. The average monthly wage gaps (all included) are: 24% for managers, 17% for technicians and supervisors, and 0% for manual workers and office employees.

For managers, the 24% gender wage gap can be partially explained by a difference in age (women managers are on average 9 years younger) and seniority. Furthermore, 41 men (compared to 4 women) have work accommodation, also taken into account in these figures; and 7 male managers (compared to only 1 female) are paid an on-call compensation.

For the technicians and supervisors, the wage gap of 17% cannot be justified only by the age and seniority differences (the gap linked to seniority is 8%). In this case, it is particularly the effect of accommodation which comes into play: 50 men, compared to only 7 women; 16 men (1 woman) are paid the on-call compensation; and 89% of overtime is taken up by men.

Lastly, for the manual workers and office employees, the salary levels are identical. The average age of women is four years less than that of men, and the index-linked gap for seniority is 5%. Accommodation remains different: 21 men are lodged (only 1 woman); 13 men are paid the on-call compensation. But these advantages are largely compensated by a better positioning of the more qualified female manual workers than their male equivalents (among manual workers, there are less women, but they have had more promotions than men).

All in all, this example shows that, in this company, the wage gaps are larger higher in the hierarchy. This can be explained by seniority (the company is beginning to integrate more female managers, but they are younger and so have less seniority), but particularly by the allocation of bonuses, particularly for accommodation, “reserved” for so-called masculine jobs (men are responsible for the water reservoirs). Therefore, the way to achieving equal wages is to promote a better gender balance in these posts.
2. Introduce a new job evaluation system

Wage gaps can be explained by two major sources: a gap for an equivalent job (see above), and the existence of jobs of comparable value, not paid at the same level. Job evaluation makes it possible to attribute a value to each job and put them in a correct order. Then jobs are divided into groups and pay is attributed to each group. Job evaluation is only suitable for larger enterprises with a significant number of jobs to compare.

Two principles play an essential role in this system: firstly, the nature of the job is the criterion used in job evaluation, quite independently of the intrinsic qualities of the person who is doing the job, i.e. the job is evaluated, not the services of the person occupying it; secondly, the principle of “equal pay for work of equal value”, i.e. more or less equivalent functions are paid the same. This is of particular importance, when comparing “men’s” and “women’s” jobs and explains why a good job evaluation system is an effective way of re-evaluating women’s pay and reducing the gulf between men and women’s pay.

When classifying jobs, there can be various phases, depending on the system, which is used. It is important to bear in mind gender neutrality at each stage of the process. The following phases can be identified:

- Description of the job – the content of the job is described very precisely and its significant components are listed.
- Analysis of the job – uniform analysis on the basis of the description. Each job is classified in line with a series of identical criteria.
- Evaluation of the job - determining its value on the basis of an evaluation table.
- Classification of the job – distribution of jobs in groups of equivalent jobs.

3 main areas can be specified:

- Skills: Education/experience; problem solving; social skills (communication, cooperation, empathy…)
- Responsibility: for material resources and information, for people, for planning, development…
- Working conditions : physical conditions, mental conditions

Among these different factors, certain are in general under-estimated in traditional systems (empathy, responsibility for other people (including for example the sick, or children…) or indeed mental conditions (stress, monotony…).

Gender discrimination is avoided if:

- the content of the job is described in a gender-neutral way (never referring to gender in the description);
- all relevant components of the job are described (it is impossible to evaluate something which is not described);
- job evaluation is carried out in a gender-neutral way (without taking into account whether a woman or a man does the job);
- each job is systematically examined according to the same criteria;
- all the phases of the evaluation process and procedures are scrupulously implemented.
Example of criteria to integrate

Avoiding over-evaluation of heavy loads: when assessing this criterion, take into account not only weight, but also the duration and repetition of movement. Female-dominated jobs can require physical force in particular ways and for specific aims, but this criterion will be overlooked (for example, a nurse lifting a patient). Inversely, over-evaluating the criterion « lifting heavy loads » for male-dominated occupations is frequent. Female-dominated professions (sometimes even in the same company) can require lifting equivalent weights, but in many repeated movements, which are less visible and so are not compensated. Example: in supermarkets, it has been proved that cashiers (often female) in supermarkets lift several tonnes of weight per day - a criterion not integrated into their pay: however, for the warehouse workers (mostly men) who lift heavy loads, this criterion is taken into account if the loads exceed 20kg.

Avoiding over-evaluation of availability: particularly in managerial posts, this criterion, which is potentially highly discriminatory and not always necessary for successfully doing the job, is becoming increasingly important. Example: in a town council, it was shown that women managers tend to arrive early in the morning and take lunch on the run, in order to be able to go home a little earlier (but often not until 6.30 pm!), whereas male managers arrive later in the day, at the same time as the elected officials, and stay later. It was perceived (by the elected officials) that - although the results of male and female managers were the same - the men were working longer hours and were therefore more committed. As a result, the men received more promotions than the women.

Recognising informal qualities necessary for the job: these are the individual skills required for carrying out a job successfully, but which cannot usually be obtained by formal training or experience. The aim is the give value to all the elements acquired in other spheres of life (outside work), such as the domestic sphere, or in out-of-work social activities (charity work, sports, personal interests...). Non-discriminatory evaluation methods used in different countries recognise generic or transversal competencies, which particularly concern inter-relational skills (relations with colleagues, customers, patients, students, etc.), and are relevant in a great majority of jobs, particularly those which are female-dominated. Example: care services.

Giving value to the multidimensional nature of a job: situations such as carrying out several tasks simultaneously, jumping from one task to another, or being frequently interrupted, are not always considered as polyvalence because they come under the responsibilities of one post; but should be given greater value. Example: “support” jobs like secretarial work, often under-valued in companies.

Enlarging the responsibility criterion: take into account not only material or budgetary responsibilities, but also responsibility for third parties (young people, patients, teams, old people...), communication, assistance or protection of the confidential nature of files.

Recognition of human relations: the current evolution of work calls increasingly on an individual’s capacities to communicate and exchange information, whatever their job (low hierarchical level or management, industrial or service jobs).

Recognition of new work constraints: respecting delays, extreme timetable pressures, the multiplicity of roles (responding to conflicting and contradictory expectations), emotional stress (heavy involvement with violent, confused or psychotic people, or responsibility for extreme activities of life-threatening situations...), pressure for results, competition between workers, dangers of unemployment... All of these new constraints introduce sources of stress and mental fatigue which should be integrated into the job definition, just like other working conditions usually mentioned (noise, smell, mobility, dirtiness, etc.).
It is true that certain measures aimed at reducing the gender pay gap can have a direct cost for the enterprise. However, in the medium and long term, there are benefits for the enterprise:

- Boosting the company’s productivity: more fairly-paid workers are better workers
- Attracting and retaining highly-qualified women candidates for posts
- Developing transparent pay structures and job evaluation schemes facilitates human resource management
- Improving employee relations within the company
- Ensuring compliance with the law in this field: avoiding costly legal claims
- Improving the enterprise’s image
- Developing the corporate social responsibility of the enterprise

**Chef’s Notes and Warnings**

- Sometimes even union representatives fear that measures to close the gender pay gap will be carried out to the detriment of general wage rises. In order to avoid this, a specific budget for catching-up the pay gap should be set aside which does not affect the overall wages budget.
- Some middle management executives consider that it is “normal” that a woman on maternity leave does not benefit from any wage rise. We can therefore see that this question requires profound cultural changes by all enterprise actors. In reality, the amounts are extremely low in comparison to the budgets set aside for example for communication and marketing for large enterprises.
- Implementing methods of job evaluation is difficult: they require a structural modification of the classification system, an implication of the social partners and a capacity of expertise.
- All these measures obviously have a direct cost: nonetheless, this cost can later be reimbursed by other business advantages, including improvements in performance and motivation, brand image, etc. (see chapter 2)
Team Cooking: With Who and How?

- The first partners to invite to these wage discussions are the employee representatives (if they exist): trying to negotiate on wage inequalities will enhance employee loyalty and reinforce the social dialogue.

- Carrying out a diagnosis of wage inequalities and implementing a new, non-discriminatory method of evaluation may require using the help of an outside expert in statistics or human resource methods including job evaluation.

Opinions and Experiences from Other Chefs

"We have set aside 1 million euros over 3 years to correct gender disparities in seniority and in equivalent posts. In 2006, 113 women’s wages were increased by an average of 6%. For the moment, we have targeted workers who have worked in the company for a long time. This is where the main gaps occur.”

Antoinette Prost, Sustainable Development Manager, AXA Insurance

“Scottish Enterprise and Careers Scotland are committed to equal opportunities both as an employer and as a service provider. Being a partner in the Close the Gap project [EQUAL project aiming to reduce the gender pay gap] is an important element of our work. We would encourage Scottish business to embrace pay equality and realise the business benefits, such as improved recruitment and staff retention, that this can bring.”

Charlie Woods, Chief Economist and Senior Director of Strategy, Scottish Enterprise
EDF (electricity) has observed a pay gap of between 5 and 12%, depending on the categories, and has therefore decided, in its 2002 collective agreement, to include a catch-up rate of 4.9% of wage increases for women over 3 years.

In Sweden, 160 companies (9 000 employees) had made an adjustment for work of comparable value, between 2001 and 2005.

Schneider Electric (electronics) has committed to reducing the gender pay gap to below 1%. This enterprise has observed that the gap increases after 10 years of service and can be explained by the more frequent career breaks which women have: “we must take into account that when an employee ‘misses’ an individual pay rise, no ‘catch-up’ is carried out”. This concerns particularly the executive level of the company, which is going to earmark 0.2% of its total wages bill to achieving this reduction.

AXA (insurance) has earmarked at specific budget of approximately 1 million euros over a 3-year period, beyond the individual and general pay rises planned. The criterion used will be the difference between the median wage of women and men. This gap is greater than 10% for the subscription and management of contracts, and so priority has been given to the female staff in this department. Although 1 million euros is a very large amount of money, it represents only 0.1% of AXA’s total annual wage bill.
7. Recipes for Work-Life balance
Ensuring Gender Equality in Work-Life Balance Practices

Why “Cook” Work-life Balance Recipes?

The theme of work-life balance is directly linked to gender equality. As more and more women work and some manage to reach managerial posts, family constraints are becoming a real issue for human resource management.

Furthermore, this theme is also becomingly increasing interesting for men, particularly fathers or men with other family responsibilities (elderly, disabled...), including executives, who want to take a more important role in the family. How is it possible to facilitate the work organisation of employees (both men and women) with family responsibilities (children or dependant relations)? How can solutions be found to insufficient childcare, which can add to absenteeism? These recipes aim to provide solutions to these questions, and many more.
A handful of company data

- Indicator 1: Weekly duration of work (men/women)
- Indicator 2: Amount of overtime (number of hours) per year (men/women)
- Indicator 3: Proportion of part-time work, by sex and occupational category
- Indicator 4: Number of employees working atypical hours (shiftwork, nightwork, weekends…) (men/women)
- Indicator 5: Level of absenteeism (not including maternity leave)
- Indicator 6: Number of maternity leaves per year
- Indicator 7: Number of long leaves (parental, sabbatical, others…) (men/women)

A small smattering of staff, mixed with a drop of willingness:
- Human resource department (in larger companies)
- Company director/other managers (in smaller companies)

A large portion of reflection and organisation.
Only a small pinch of money for working-time arrangements, but a larger investment for developing employee services.

Data on work-life balance

Results of the survey of Estonian enterprises (Ministry of Social Affairs, 2007):

- 96% of the managers have not compared the working time of male and female employees;
- Overtime work is not rare in 55% of the companies;
- In 40% of the companies, all employees can determine their working time in a flexible manner;
- In 84% of the companies, employees can change their working schedule by agreement with other employees;
- In 75% of the companies, women can work part-time whereas it is possible in 72% of the companies for men, and in 73% of the companies for managers; in 72% of the companies, employees are enabled to determine the beginning and the end of their working days, if necessary due to family needs;
- In only 4% of the companies, childcare facilities are provided;
- 85% of managers consider flexible arrangement of working time substantially increases the efficiencies of work and produces, in the long run, better results.
Eurostat/Estonian data:

Even if the findings from the Estonian survey show that the Estonian enterprises propose flexible hours and are relatively family-friendly, the general statistical data available tempers these observations:

- The Estonian fertility rate (1.55 in 2006) is one of the lowest in Europe
- Women (aged 20-50) with small children (under the age of 12) work 31.9 percentage points less than women of the same age group without children, whereas men with small children work 16.6 points more than men without children
- Similarly, the employment rate for mothers with 3 children (or more) is 39% (compared to 41% for the whole of Europe)... and 89.4% for Estonian fathers with 3 (or more) children
- The part-time rate is low, as in almost all the newer Member States: 11.3% for Estonian women, and 4.3% for Estonian men (compared to 31.2% average for European women, and 7.7% average for European men – Eurostat 2006). Nonetheless, it should be noted that the part-time rate for Estonian women is twice that of men.

Legal framework: Gender Equality Act

§11 (3): “Employers as persons promoting gender equality (...) create working conditions which are suitable for both women and men and support the combination of work and family life, taking into account the needs of employees.

Basic Instructions:

Improving the organisation of working time for all employees, both male and female

1. **Reduce atypical working hours (if possible)** (see indicators 1, 2 and 4): atypical working hours includes working late in the day, night-working, unusual working hours, weekend working and shift work. Carry out a total review of working time arrangements in order to integrate employees’ needs and wishes. Use a volunteer system for an obligatory atypical working hours, and try to change the working hours of the people concerned regularly.

2. **Reduce (if possible) the number and duration of long breaks in working hours imposed on employees**: this is often a particular phenomenon for shop staff such as cashiers who have to work at rush hours (mornings and evenings) with a long break in between, or cleaning staff who have to work outside office hours (early mornings and late evenings).
3. **Set out a clear timetable sufficiently in advance**: over at least 2 weeks, giving at least a week’s notice of any changes (in working hours). Introduce possibilities for simplifying the replacement of workers (for example working in pairs).

4. **Establish a Time Charter**: introduce a charter, to be displayed on the company premises, to raise awareness among all employees about working time organisation. The charter should advise for example: limiting all unnecessary extra working hours; limiting the number, and duration, of meetings per day; not beginning any meetings before 9.00 a.m. or after 5.00 p.m. The hours of part-time staff should be taken into account when organising important meetings (see indicator 3).

5. **Introduce working-time arrangements**: introduce the possibility of reducing, or increasing, an employee’s working hours throughout their career in the enterprise, and according to their personal situation (possibility to go part-time for a specific period, possibility of varying working time over a year, or over several years using a sort of “time bank” for example). Possibility of teleworking...

6. **Facilitate the return to work after long periods of leave** (maternity leave, parental leave, sabbaticals...) (see indicators 6 and 7): facilitate employees’ contact with their employer during their leave (electronic newsletter, company newsletter...); set up a return-to-work interview before coming back to work; provide training to update any skills if necessary.

## More Advanced Recipes

### Development of employee services

1. **Assistance for childcare**\(^{14}\) (from ☒ to ☒ ☒ ☒):
   - Give parents childcare benefit to help pay for their childcare;
   - Develop a temporary area designed for children (for example aged 3 years and over) in the enterprise premises;
   - Participate in the creation of an inter-company crèche (in a particular area, in partnership with local authorities)\(^15\);

\(^{14}\) See resources about child care in Estonia:
- legal acts concerning pre-school educational facilities, social welfare, public health (www.riigiteataja.ee)
- Enterprise Estonia business portal Aktiva list of services for child care services (www.aktiva.ee)
- website of the Bureau of the Minister of Demographic Affairs, e.g. child care terminology and the practical meanings of the concepts (www.rahvastikuminister.ee)

\(^{15}\) Pre-school educational facility act regulates the concepts of creche, kinder-garten, etc. Playroom as such falls under the control of the social welfare act (121-128) and health requirements for a childcare facility directive (documents are retrievable from www.riigiteataja.ee). In practice the the playroom
- Reserve childcare places in existing structures (crèches, childcare centres...) for members of staff;
- Create an in-company playroom (particularly for companies where atypical hours are worked): this measure only applies to large companies and is more difficult and costly to implement because it means that the company should work with another service-provider, or ask one of its own departments to take charge of the project realization. Furthermore, employee needs (and wishes) for such a playroom need to be carefully measured in a preliminary study: certain employees are not keen on in-house childcare facilities, particularly when they live a long way away.

2. **Assistance for elderly care**;
   - Establish a data base of local care centres (day care and permanent care) for elderly people. This can be usually be done easily by contacting the local town council;
   - Provide assistance for employees in looking for suitable care for elderly relations. This could be one of the services provide in the “conciergerie” system (see 4 below);

3. **Assistance for solving transport difficulties**: setting-up car-sharing arrangements, buses to pick up and take home staff (for large companies), taxi subscriptions for exceptional circumstances (no public transport, emergencies...), purchase of bicycles or motorcycles for use by staff...

4. **Services for all employees**: the “conciergerie” principle. This involves offering services to company employees in the form of an office (staffed by a concierge) located on the company premises, which employees can call on to help with any personal issues which can help to resolve their work-life balance issues, for example: home repairs (broken lock, mechanical problem, plumber...) or exceptional childcare (sick child on the day of an important meeting), dry-cleaning services... Although this possibility is more commonly found in large enterprises, it can be applied on a smaller scale in small companies where some of these services can be provided by an assistant among other tasks.

differs from a chreche / kindergarten for the former does not provide education (does not have the relevant licence).
The business benefits of flexible working practices are many and include; enhanced employer brand image, improved productivity and motivation, flexible resourcing, reduced sickness absence, reduced turn-over …

Developing family-friendly measures has other positive impacts: allowing more women to return to work after maternity or parental leave; avoiding that staff returning after a long period of leave feel isolated and perform less well; ensuring that staff (men and women) are less bothered by personal issues while at work and are thus freer to concentrate on their work and perform to the best of their ability.

Chef's Notes and Warnings

- It is absolutely essential that the recipes proposed on this sheet are made available both to women and men, to parents and those who do not have children, to executives and non-executives. Work-life balance is necessary for all whether it concerns family constraints or other outside activities such as leisure or hobbies…

- It is also important to make clear that staff benefiting from working time adjustments and arrangements should have the option of changing back to the "normal" working hours of the company. The company must ensure that those staff are not discriminated against, and can benefit from the same advantages and promotions as other workers.

- Work-life balance is one of the themes of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), and demonstrates the commitment of a company to the well-being of its employees. However, it can inversely appear like a “Big Brother” approach, giving the company the right to ‘meddle’ in its employees’ privates lives, for example making sure that they are totally available at all times (in-company crèches for example will take sick children much more readily than publicly provided crèches). Therefore, even if work-life balance should become a preoccupation of enterprises, it is important to clearly set the limits between personal and working life. In order to do this, it is necessary to seek employees’ opinions and, if possible, allow them (or their representatives) participate and discuss the enterprises’ proposals.
Team Cooking: With Who and How?

- The company should seek the involvement of the employee representatives and committees.
- Depending on the different measures: local councils, service-providers, transport companies...

Opinions and Experiences from Other Chefs

“The work life balance funding will allow us to develop more flexible ways of working, help us to improve scheduling and enable everyone to work smarter; It will also allow us to address issues such as staff retention and ultimately to enhance job satisfaction.”

Gianni Riatch,
General Manager of the London Hilton

“If we show flexibility to an employee, invariably they will show us greater flexibility at times of heavy workload or during holiday periods.”

Female Managing Director

“We often think that work life balance is an issue only for women. But our research shows that many men would like to have shorter hours and more flexibility in the way they work. More men that women want to work flexitime (37% compared to 33%) or work compressed working week (37% compared to 28%). So a flexible can-do attitude to working arrangements will help companies attract and keep both men and women in their workforce.”

Margaret Hodge
UK Government Minister (first Minister for Children)

The executives involved with their families also develop the valuable qualities in the enterprise: the spirit of negotiations, the capacity to find compromises and resolve conflicts, and to handle several tasks at once.

Study by Clarck University, USA
Promoting Work-life balance for men: Five Boroughs NHS (National Health Service) Trust (UK) has successfully raised the male agenda by taking into account the needs of new fathers, flexible workers and non-resident dads (custody issues) with the aim of improving gender equality. A budget of 143,000 euros has been devoted to these measures including appointing a permanent Work-life Balance Manager, and promoting childcare responsibilities for fathers. They have a comprehensive paternity/co-parenting policy with leave at full-pay.

Childcare in the RATP (France): The Parisian transport network has created a service called „Pimprenelle” (fairy in the „Sleeping Beauty” cartoon) for all parents. Due to the atypical working hours of its staff and to the feminisation of the enterprise, this service tries to offer the best possible solution to parents (access to reserved places in childcare centres, help in finding a childminder…).

Flexible working: British Telecom (BT) (UK): anyone in BT can request flexible working arrangements as part of their career/life planning discussions with their line manager. Part-time, flexitime/staggered hours, home-/tele-/flexiplace, compressed working week, job-share, annualised hours, and term-time working are all on offer. The line manager reviews each request on an individual basis taking into account business needs as well as the more practical details of the employee’s facilities at home.
Cooking, and the choice of what we eat, have a major impact on our health. It is essential to adapt the choice of dishes to cook according to health concerns (high cholesterol, diabetes, food allergies…).

Learning about one’s health can serve as an “appetizer” - or impetus - for action.

Similarly, when working with gender equality, it is important to know the current state of affairs in order to ensure that new polices implemented are suitable. This is the reason why, in this annex, we propose:
- a general overview of the “health” of Estonia as regards gender equality in the labour market (in comparison to EU averages);
- a short gender equality “health-check” for your company.
The Gender Equality “Health” of Estonia Compared to European Union Averages

The following table sets out some of the basic indicators of Estonia’s state of health concerning gender equality in the workplace. It has been divided into “Signs of relative good health” and “Health warnings”.

Figures are placed in “Signs of relative good health” when they are better than EU averages: nonetheless, it is important to note that this does not mean that they do not require attention. The “Health warnings” highlight areas where Estonia measures up less well as compared to EU averages.
### Employment rate

**Eurostat figures for 2006.** The employment rate is obtained by dividing the number of men/women (aged 15-64) in employment by the total male/female population of the same age group.

- Estonian men have a higher employment rate than women (71% compared to 65.3%).
- Although it requires attention, this gap is the third lowest in the EU.
- The women's employment rate for Estonia (65.3%) is higher than the EU average (57.2%).
- For older workers (55-64 years), the Estonian female employment rate (59.2%) is higher than that for men (57.5%), and 25 percentage points higher than the EU average for this age-group.

**Estonian men have a higher employment rate than women.**

**Although it requires attention, this gap is the third lowest in the EU.**

**The women's employment rate for Estonia is higher than the EU average.**

**For older workers, the Estonian female employment rate is higher than that for men.**

### Unemployment rate

**Eurostat figures for 2006.** The unemployment rate represents unemployed persons as a percentage of the labour force.

- Male unemployment (6.2%) is higher than female unemployment (5.6%).
- It is lower, for both sexes, than the EU average.

**Male unemployment is higher than female unemployment.**

**It is lower, for both sexes, than the EU average.**

### Part-time work

**Eurostat figures for 2006.** The distinction between full-time and part-time work is made on the basis of the spontaneous answer given by the respondent. It is impossible to establish a more exact definition due to the variations in working hours between Member States and branches of industry.

- As in many of the newer EU Member States, rates of part-time work are relatively low.
- Nonetheless, significantly more Estonian women (11.3%) work part-time than their male counterparts (4.3%).

**As in many of the newer EU Member States, rates of part-time work are relatively low.**

**Nonetheless, significantly more Estonian women work part-time than their male counterparts.**

### Gender pay gap

**Eurostat figures for 2005.** Differences between men’s and women’s gross hourly earnings as a percentage of men’s average gross hourly earnings.

**Estonia has the biggest pay gap in Europe (25%), together with Cyprus.**

**It is situated well above the EU average of 15%.**

**Gender Equality Monitoring Survey (2005) results show that 43% of Estonian men (and 25% of Estonian women!) felt that men’s salaries should be higher than women’s.**

### Share of domestic tasks

**Figures for 1999 from Eurostat, “Statistics in Focus 2006” : Structure of use of time, in hours and minutes per day (age 20-74)**

**Estonian women spend significantly more time every day on domestic tasks (5hrs 2mins) than men (2hrs 48mins).**

**For the EU countries considered in the study, only Italian women spent more time on domestic duties.**

**However, even if there is a major gender gap, Estonian men spend the most time on domestic tasks of all EU men.**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in management</th>
<th>Horizontal desegregation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eurostat figures for 2005</td>
<td>The proportion of female managers in Estonia (37%) is above the EU average (32%), and the 3\textsuperscript{rd} highest in the EU.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nonetheless, there is still a significant gap with men which must be closed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statistics Estonia, Labour Force Survey 2005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Youth education level</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eurostat figures for 2006. This indicator is defined as the percentage of young people aged 20-24 years having attained at least upper secondary attainment level.</td>
<td>In Estonia, girls are much more successful at school (89.8%) than boys (74.1%).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The gender gap is much bigger than the EU average (6%) and is growing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quick Gender Equality Health-check of Your Enterprise

Before implementing a gender equality strategy in your enterprise, you will need to carry out a comprehensive analysis of the current gender equality situation. In order to set goals for achieving gender equality in your company, you need data to work on. Only objective statistical data can help to uncover gender inequalities that may otherwise be considered natural or related to individuals’ free will.

This is why the Gender Equality Act article 11 section 2 sets forth that the employer must collect quantitative data that allows employers and other institutions to assess whether men and women have been treated equally in the company or not.

The following tables can be used to get a first overview of the current situation in your company. This can help you to find starting points for choosing and implementing recipes. For instance if, in your company, there are more or less equal numbers of men and women among staff and the number of men and women in management corresponds ratio-wise to the number of men and women among staff, you will not have to focus on that topic at first. Similarly, if is no wage gap, you may leave the job assessment analysis for later.

The tables help you to find out what are the most clear indicators of inequality, which should be analysed in more detail. Comparing numbers and proportions does not replace complete analysis of the organisational structure, values, norms, behaviours and policies from a gender aspect. This kind of analysis is an important first step to draft a plan for reducing gender inequality in the company.

Employee data can be retrieved from the personnel and wage files. For analysing women’s and men’s different status, you need to review the company’s internal code of conduct, guidelines, contracts, wage systems, but also the traditions and attitudes that have developed over time.

These tables also enable you to inform the workers as to how the duties, responsibilities, rights and opportunities of men and women are ensured in the company as set forth in the Gender Equality Act.
1. Overview of where the women and men work in your company

For describing the structure of employees you need to compare the proportions of women and men and their presence in different job categories in the company (i.e. management, finances. You can also use classification systems like ISCO or EW, or the classification that is used in your company)

Job categories vary by company. Here categories should be presented based on the company hierarchy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Category</th>
<th>Women %</th>
<th>Men %</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employees (average of the previous 12-month period, or current month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. category (e.g. top management)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. category (e.g. middle management)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. category (e.g. specialists)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. category</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. category</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:
- How many women and men there are in top management;
- Any jobs in the company where there are only women or men;
- Whether, the higher the level, the more / less there is gender balance.

2. Types of employment contracts

In order to identify differences you have to compare the proportions of men and women based on their employment contracts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment Contract</th>
<th>Women %</th>
<th>Men %</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified term contracts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed-term contract</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table helps to clarify and point out:
- Whether there are any differences, and if so, how big are they, between men’s and women’s wages;
- Whether men’s and women’s jobs valued differently.

### 3. Wages and wage gaps

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job category / occupation</th>
<th>Total of women’s wages divided by total of women employees in certain category (average women’s wage)</th>
<th>Total of men’s wages divided by total of men employees in certain category (average men’s wage)</th>
<th>Women’s average wage from men’s average wage (wage difference)</th>
<th>% of total wages</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:
- Whether there are any differences, and if so, how big are they, between men’s and women’s employment contracts.

### 3.1. Wages, wage differences and job differences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wage groups (based on job categories, etc.)</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>% women</th>
<th>% employees</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>% men</th>
<th>% employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:
• Whether the jobs and positions in the company have been distributed between men and women so that they create differences in wages and in other work related payments;
• Where the wages differences are highest – in top management or among the specialists.

3.2. Individual bonuses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Car</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Women as a proportion of all those having received a bonus, %</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Men as a proportion of all those having received a bonus, %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mobile phone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation for petrol expenses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation of telephone costs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:

• What kind of bonuses men and women get.

For more thorough analysis, similar data can be compared within one job category.

4. Hours worked

Based on how this data is collected in your company, you can analyse monthly, quarterly or annual data.

This data will give you an overview of in which jobs gender-based differences occur. Also, this information can be used for analysing working time organisation, wage gaps, career development, etc.

5.1. Overtime (based on annual report)
The table helps to clarify and point out:

- Whether there are differences in paying men and women for overtime hours.

From the aspect of work and family life reconciliation it would be useful to compare the duration of men’s and women’s working time and night work / on-call times.

6. **Number of paid leave days for women and men** (based on different leave categories)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paid leave categories</th>
<th>Days used by women employees</th>
<th>% of the total days foreseen for women employees</th>
<th>% of women employees</th>
<th>Days used by men</th>
<th>% of total days foreseen for men employees</th>
<th>% of men employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annual leave</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental leave</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:

- Whether women and men employees’ have used their rights and opportunities equally.

7. **Women’s and men’s careers**

Women’s and men’s career paths are usually very different. The next table will help you to analyse how men and women move towards positions with more responsibilities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promoted (advancement to a position with more responsibilities)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Job</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Women and men employees participating in training

In order to compare men and women participating in training you need the training volume in hours and the costs.

8.1. Training volume

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Volume of training in hours or in days</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X hours / days</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:
- Who participates more in training, men or women;
- Whether participation in training is proportional to the number of women and men employees in the company.

8.2. Training costs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total cost of training (training activities + additional costs, e.g. accommodation, travel, etc.)</th>
<th>Women having participated in training</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Men having participated in training</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The table helps to clarify and point out:
- Whether the company has invested equally to training both women and men or not;
• Whether the training has had any influence on the participant’s career path (promotions, etc.).

You can get a more thorough overview of the situation when you compare women’s and men’s participations in different kinds of trainings (language courses, management courses, vocational training, etc.).

To see whether investments have facilitated career advancement for both women and men, you should compare the results with previous tables.

9. Recruiting women and men

We suggest you use the data covering the previous 12 months or the last recruitment period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Management</th>
<th>1. job category</th>
<th>2. job category</th>
<th>3. job category</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruited</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from candidates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruited</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from candidates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender analysis of the candidates and recruitees helps you to review the recruitment procedure and criteria in order to balance the number of women and men employees in the company and to decrease gender-based vocational segregation.

The above tables give general guidelines on what kind of data to gather and how to analyse it for mapping the situation of women and men in your company. For gaining a clearer picture, concrete issues (see chapter 3) should be analysed and examined more thoroughly.
What is the core of the law?

The act was adopted on 1 May 2004. The adoption of Gender Equality Act (GEA) can be considered a major milestone in Estonian legislation. Gender equality is a fundamental human right. In Estonia the Constitution of the Republic sets forth the basic rights for an individual (§ 12 the right not to be discriminated against and § 19 the right for free self-realization) and GEA with its definitions regulates more specifically what methods and promoting mechanisms have to be used for achieving gender equality in the society.

Who are concerned?

The Act prohibits discrimination based on sex in the private and public sector. The obligation to promote gender equality applies to employers, state and local government agencies, and educational and research institutions.

What are the employers’ duties?

According to GEA article 6 Discrimination in professional life, the employer has to have strong reasons not related to gender for making decisions regarding

- selecting for employment and or a vacant position;
- hiring or admitting to practical training;
- promoting;
- selecting for training or performing a task or sending a person from one sex to training and thus overlooking another person with higher qualification and from the opposite sex.

The activities of the employer will be considered discriminating if the employer:

- overlooks a person due to pregnancy, child-birth or other circumstances related to gender or limits the duration or extent of work for the same reasons;
• upon hiring, establishes conditions which put persons of one sex at a particular disadvantage compared with persons of the other sex;
• establishes conditions for remuneration or other conditions which are less favourable regarding an employee or employees of one sex compared with an employee or employees of the other sex doing the same or equivalent work;
• directs work, distributes work assignments or establishes working conditions such that persons of one sex are put at a particular disadvantage compared with persons of the other sex;
• harasses sexually or fails to ensure that employees are protected from sexual harassment in the working environment. An employer is responsible for failure to perform the duty of care if the employer is aware or should reasonably be aware that sexual harassment has occurred and fails to apply the necessary measures to terminate such harassment;
• downgrades the working conditions of an employee or terminates an employment relationship with him or her due to the fact that the employee has made reference to the rights and obligations provided for in this Act;
• punishes an employee under disciplinary procedure, transfers an employee to another position, terminates an employment relationship or promotes the termination thereof due to reasons connected with gender.

Article 11 **Employers as persons promoting gender equality** states that the employer has to promote equal treatment of men and women, more specifically, the employer has to:

- act so that both men and women are employed to fill vacant positions;
- make sure the number of men and women hired to different positions is as equal as possible;
- ensure equal treatment for men and women upon promotion;
- create working conditions which are suitable for both women and men;
- support the combination of work and family life, taking into account the needs of employees;
- ensure that employees are protected from sexual harassment in the working environment;
- inform employees of the rights ensured by GEA;
- regularly provide relevant information to employees and/or their representatives concerning equal treatment for men and women in the organisation and measures taken in order to promote equality.

It is also set forth in GEA that the employer has to explain his or her activities:

- To competent bodies when such a body is assessing a complaint application to decide whether discrimination based on gender has occurred. The employer has to explain the reasons and motives of his or her behaviour or decision that was considered discriminating by the applicant (‘reversed burden of proof’, i.e. to present proof that the action taken was not discriminative). If the employer refuses to give explanations to the competent body, such behaviour shall be deemed to be equal to acknowledgement of discrimination by the person. (Article 4)
- To the person upon their written request concerning the person who was
  selected instead of them to fulfill a task for the employer (job, training, etc.)
  (Article 6 section 1). The response has to be given within 10 days starting from
  the time the request was submitted and it has to be in written format including
  the following information:
  - length of employment
  - education
  - work experience and other skills required for the work
  - other skills and reasons which give the selected person a clear advantage
    (Article 7 section 1)

- To the person who believes that he or she has been discriminated against and
  who has submitted a written request concerning the employer’s activities. The
  response has to be in a written format and given within 15 days starting from
  the time the request was submitted. (Article 7 section 2)

- To the employee upon his or her demand regarding the bases of calculation of
  salaries. (Article 7 section 3)

**What can the employee do in case s/he feels that s/he is
discriminated against?**

According to the GEA article 6 *Discrimination in professional life* and article 8 *Discriminating offer of employment or training*, the injured party may demand compensation for damage (incl. non-patrimonial damage) and termination of the harmful activity.

The amount of the compensation will be decided by the court and it will consider the scope, duration, nature of the discrimination and whether the violator has eliminated the discriminating circumstances or not (article 13).

The claim has to be presented to the court in order to claim damages within one year to the date from the time the injured party learned about discrimination or should have learned about it.

Other institutions where the injured party may turn to:
- for advice – Ministry of Social Affairs Gender Equality Department, Gender
  Equality Commissioner;
- for submitting a petition – the Gender Equality Commissioner, the Chancellor of
  Justice, Labor Dispute Commission.

**What are the sanctions?**

According to the Penal Code article 152 *Violation of equality*, in case a person’s rights are unlawfully restricted based on sex or a person is granted unlawful
preferences based on sex, the offender is punishable by a fine up to 300 fine units (18 000 kr) or by detention (up to 30 days).

The act of violating equality for at least a second time or causing significant damage to the injured party, is punishable by a pecuniary punishment in the value of 30-500 daily rates (the value of the daily rate is calculated based on the average daily income of the offender’s previous year’s taxable income after deductions) or up to one year of imprisonment (Penal Code article 44).
Useful contacts

Governmental institutions

**Gender Equality Commissioner**
Gonsiori 29, 15027 Tallinn
Tel/fax: +372 626 9259
www.svv.ee
info@svv.ee

Tasks
*based on GEA, this is not an all-inclusive list!*
- monitoring the compliance with the requirements of GEA as an impartial expert;
- analysing the impact of laws on gender equality and advising the government institutions on amending laws and promoting gender equality.
- accepting applications from persons and provides opinions concerning possible cases of discrimination

**Gender Equality Department**
Ministry of Social Affairs
Gonsiori 29, 15027 Tallinn
Tel: +372 626 9301
www.sm.ee
info@sm.ee

Mission:
To develop strategies and measures for reducing gender inequality and promote gender equality in all areas of life.

Tasks:
*based on GEA, this is not an all-inclusive list!*
- consulting interested parties on implementing the principle of equal treatment and giving instructions for implementing GEA
- analyzing the effect of GEA on achieving gender equality in the society
- publishing reports on implementation of the principle of equal treatment of men and women
Chancellor of Justice  
Kohtu 8, 15193 Tallinn  
Tel: +372 693 8404  
www.oiguskantsler.ee  
info@oiguskantsler.ee

Mission: 
Based on the Constitution and other Acts, to review work of governing bodies and to resolve discrimination disputes which arise between persons in private law.

Tasks: 
* based on Chancellor of Justice Act, this is not an all-inclusive list!  
  - accepting applications from persons and provides opinions concerning possible cases of discrimination  
  - carrying out conciliation proceedings

Labour inspectorate  
Gonsiori 29, 10147 Tallinn  
Tel: +372 640 6000  
www.ti.ee/ (E-R 10.00-14.00)  
ti@ti.ee

Labour Dispute Committee  
General info: +372 600 0330  
www.ti.ee/index.php?page=121&info.tvk@ti.ee

Mission: 
Exercise supervision over the working environments compliance with the requirements of legislation regulating occupational health and safety and labour relations.

Tasks: this is not an all-inclusive list! 
* exercising state supervision in the field of labor, collecting and analyzing relative data and investigating labor disputes  
* carrying out and resolving petitions of persons on working environment issues  
* resolving individual labour disputes pursuant to procedure prescribed by law

European Commission  
http://www.gendermainstreaming-cop.eu  
www.europa.eu.int/comm/equal

National partners

Tallinn University Open University Center for Continuing Education (koolitus@tlu.ee) / The Estonian Women’s Studies and Resource Centre (ENUT)

Gender Equality in the Organization training course 
The aim of the course is to assist institutions and private companies with gender mainstreaming and implementing the Gender Equality Act along with organizing surveillance. Training is conducted by ENUT specialists.
Unit of Gender Studies (GSU) www.ut.ee/gender

Tasks:
- teaching and research (University of Tartu Sociology and Social Policy Department)
- participating in international research projects
- carrying out applied studies
- consulting

Estonian Women’s Cooperation Chain
www.ewl.ee

Tasks:
- uniting different women’s organisations
- supporting women’s participation in the public sphere, including motivating continual education
- promoting the implementation of gender equality principle in all the spheres in Estonia
- organising and participating in projects

Estonian Women’s Organisations Roundtable (ENÜ)
www.enu.ee

Tasks:
- forming women’s organisations positions for participating in social dialogue
- organizing and participating in projects
- representing Estonia in the European Women’s Lobby

International organisations

United Nations
www.un.org/womenwatch/
www.gendermatters.eu/

International Labor Organisation
www.ilo.org/public/english/gender.htm
www.hot.ee/iloestonia/
Tools


- Colclough, C. (2004), Gender equality plans at the workplace. European Industrial Relations Observatory (EIRO) [www.eurofound.europa.eu/eiro/2004/02/study/tn0402101s.htm].


- European Foundation for the Improvement of the Living Conditions (Eurofund) [http://www.eurofound.europa.eu] and its observatory European Industrial Relations Observatory On-line (EIRO) [http://www.eurofound.europa.eu/eiro/].

- Haute Autorité de Lutte contre les Discriminations et pour l’Egalité (HALDE) [http://www.halde.fr/].


- Working Families [http://www.workingfamilies.org.uk/].

Projects carried out in Estonia

- Women to the top [www.women2top.net/ee]

- Choices and Balance [www.cb.ee]
The “recipe book” is a practical and easily readable book which is clearly worth the hour that it takes to get acquainted with it. The book gives an overview of the gender equality topic, how the employer can benefit from the gender equality principles and how to implement the principles in his or her company.

**Kristiina Kõiv, JCDecaux, Executive Director**

All who have come in contact with applying for financial support from the Structural Funds, must have noticed those fields in the end of the application form that mention gender equality. Those fields show the potential efficiency of the project and influence the assessment and outcome of receiving the support or not. The recipe book helps to understand the (deeper) meaning of those fields by giving clear examples from real life and by explaining how promoting gender equality can be beneficial for a company.

**Margo Peetsalu, Laurentum OÜ, Owner and Consultant**

Every person wishes to be treated equally. It is considered unfair to prefer someone based on their gender. This book shows what kind of results can be attained when companies decide to implement gender equality principles in their personnel policies. The benefits are obvious and all parties – the individuals, the companies and society in general – are the ‘winners’. Also, using more flexible working forms will help to alleviate the shortage of employees.

**Ruth Alas, Estonian Business School, Vice Rector of Science and Chair of Management**

This project is supported by the European Union